

The Apostolic Nature of Dr. Randy Clark

By
Genevieve Chartrand

Abstract

The controversial topic surrounding the modern-day apostle tends to evoke strong emotions in some and elicit a myriad of preconceived notions in others. Detractors often employ sweeping indictments against individuals assuming apostolic roles, particularly those associated with the New Apostolic Reformation (NAR), often resorting to language connoting deceit or worse. Among these figures, Dr. Randy Clark frequently finds himself at the center of such polemics, subject to mischaracterizations and oversimplifications.

This paper aims to underscore both the scholarly pursuit and the practical necessity acknowledged by Dr. Clark and myself. Specifically, it seeks to address and refute the assertions, misconceptions, and, in certain instances, falsehoods propagated by the critics discussed herein. These criticisms have led to inaccurate and misunderstood interpretations of Clark's teachings and practices.

Consequently, this document serves to introduce the apostolic nature of Dr. Clark within the framework of my ongoing doctoral dissertation, undertaken at Global Awakening Theological Seminary (GATS) anticipated for completion no earlier than 2027. It is important to note that this preliminary segment of the dissertation does not purport to comprehensively or exhaustively dismantle the presuppositions of the critics. Rather, it focuses on delineating aspects of Dr. Clark's apostolic character based upon a personal interview with him and proximity to his teachings. Therefore, readers are encouraged to await the forthcoming dissertation for a more comprehensive analysis.

My aspiration is that this work will provide clarity regarding Dr. Clark's apostolic nature and practices, while fostering unity within the Christian community.

At the advice of Dr. Kim Maas, whom I love dearly, I have edited this document to address one sentence where the language I used was misleading. One of my fellow students also requested that I edit their content in my Appendix. As such, I made smaller changes within to enhance clarity. This paper is the second edition, July 2024 and I will write a separate paper better detailing a response to Dr. Robert Menzies astute and helpful observation. Therefore, please keep a look out for the second paper and also my forthcoming dissertation for Global Awakening Theological Seminary.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION.....	1
OVERVIEW OF THIRD WAVE DISTINCTIVES	4
The Apostolic Nature of Dr. Randy Clark	12
The Concept of “Apostolic Authority”	12
Impartation and Equipping the Saints	32
The Concept of Revelation	40
Demonstrating the Kingdom of God.....	47
Additional Signs of the Apostolic	49
SUMMARY	61
BIBLIOGRAPHY	64
Appendix	69

INTRODUCTION

Following the Pentecostal movement (first wave) and the subsequent charismatic movement, or charismatic renewal (second wave), was a third wave consisting of a non-Pentecostal, noncharismatic, neocharismatic renewal.¹ According to Burgess, the three waves throughout the 20th century included 795 million believers, which is not only continuing to grow but is also globally surging.² The term “Third Wave” was coined by C. Peter Wagner, who shares that the name “Surfaced while I was being interviewed on this subject by *Pastoral Renewal* magazine.”³ The Third Wave became more predominant in the 1980s and 1990s, popularized by John Wimber, who taught the democratization of the gifts of the Holy Spirit and worked to equip all believers to cooperate with the Spirit of Jesus in daily life and ministry.⁴ Synan states that Wimber’s Association of Vineyard Churches “was comprised of mainline evangelicals who experienced signs and wonders but who disdained labels such as ‘Pentecostal’ or ‘charismatic.’”⁵ These evangelicals uphold many aspects of renewal theology that follow core beliefs in traditional theology but have several distinctives.

¹ Stanley M. Burgess, ed., *The New International Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements (NIDPCM)*, 5th ed. (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 2007), <https://thetdl.on.worldcat.org/oclc/951186418>, 284.

² Burgess, *NIDPCM*, 290; 284.

³ C. Peter Wagner, *The Third Wave of the Holy spirit: Encountering the Power of Signs and Wonders* (Ann Arbor, MI: Servant Publications, 1988), 15.

⁴ Burgess, *NIDPCM*, 285-90.

⁵ Vinson Synan, *The Century of the Holy Spirit: 100 Years of Pentecostal and Charismatic Renewal, 1901-2001* (Nashville, TN: Thomas Nelson, 2001), 9.

The Third Wave of the Holy Spirit has been characterized by many comparative aspects of the Pentecostal and charismatic renewals. However, there are theological distinctives leading to corresponding praxis that differ from the first two waves. In some ways, Third Wave proponents believe that the renewal has brought a deepened understanding of the Holy Spirit and his work among evangelicals, which is not a stretch since each wave has augmented the other in some way or another. One positive element of the Third Wave is noted by Gary S. Greig and Kevin Springer, who write that the Third Wave proponents “have begun to move from an unbalanced emphasis based only on the proclaimed Word to a scripturally balanced emphasis based on both the proclaimed Word and ministry in God’s power (Rom. 15:18-19; 1 Cor. 2:4-5; 4:20; 11:1; Gal. 3:5; 1 Thess. 1:5; Heb. 2:3-4; 1 Pet. 4:11; Jas. 5:13-16).”⁶

According to Burgess and McNee, it was this “rise of the ‘Signs and Wonders’ praxis and teaching associated with John Wimber and his Vineyard Fellowship,” that brought greater significance to this aspect of the renewal movement.⁷ Indeed, following the healing revival of the 1940s with William Branham, Oral Roberts, Jack Coe, and Kathryn Kuhlman in the 60s, it was necessary to move away from one great man and woman of power towards the democratization of the gifts of the Spirit. John Wimber’s ministry focused on this democratization of the gifts of the Holy Spirit to equip the saints in the work of ministry, a focus that is continued in the ministry of Dr. Randy Clark.

⁶ Gary S. Greig and Kevin N. Springer, “Introduction,” in J.I. Packer et al., *The Kingdom and the Power*, eds. Gary S. Greig and Kevin N. Springer (Ventura, CA: Regal Books, 1993), 21.

⁷ Stanley M. Burgess, and Gary B. McGee, eds., *Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements (DIPCM)* (Grand Rapids, MI: Regency Reference Library, 1988), 143.

This paper will first provide a brief overview of renewal theology Third Wave distinctives taught by Clark. The focus of this paper will then examine the continuation of the *doma* gift of apostleship with an emphasis on Clark’s apostolic nature. The concentration on Clark is partly in response to the claims of Douglas Geivett and Holly Pivec, who have mislabeled Clark and misrepresented his teachings and ways in their “guilt by association” approach in what they have written and spoken about him.

Therefore, specific accusations that have been written and spoken against Clark’s apostolic nature will be examined and proven false. I will utilize Clark’s lectures, written works, email correspondences, and a semi-structured interview conducted with him on November 16, 2023, as points of reference in my research. Additional scholarship and biblical exploration will be included throughout. I will address apostolic authority, the foundation of Clark’s approach to equipping the saints and his impartation ministry, clarify the concept of revelation, touch on the theology of demonstrating the kingdom, and conclude with additional signs of the modern-day apostolic function. I hope this paper will encourage the reader and especially that I will succeed in mitigating confusion in the Body of Christ and enhance unity among us. Even if the reader disagrees with some of the theological distinctives, we are unified in Christ. For “we were all baptized by one Spirit so as to form one body—whether Jews or Gentiles, slave or free—and we were all given one Spirit to drink” (1 Cor. 12:13).⁸

⁸ All Scripture is taken from, *The Holy Bible*, New International Version (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 2011), unless otherwise stated.

OVERVIEW OF THIRD WAVE DISTINCTIVES

In *Baptized in the Spirit*, Clark brings the reader to understand that the weight of the mission of Jesus was not only to save sinners from the consequences of sin, but also to see that the central mission of Jesus was “to inaugurate the New Covenant of the Spirit.”⁹ The gift of God’s Spirit is not a secondary aspect of the new creation, given for salvation alone, but he is the gift of God’s voice (Rom. 1:18), fulfilling the prophetic utterance of Isaiah 59:21, which the Pentecost speech of Acts 2 makes clear.¹⁰ “The point of the Pentecost story is that the New Covenant is the Spirit of prophecy (speech) equipping disciples for the mission Jesus demonstrated and then gave to them.”¹¹

The gift of God’s voice to the believer is the ability to hear him and act in obedience. When the Spirit of God reveals the Father’s will, signs and wonders may follow, which demonstrate God’s goodness, power, holiness, and love. Packer notes that the New Testament articulates that God’s power “is meant to accompany the gospel, and to find expression through its messengers and in the lives of those to whom the message comes.”¹² The immediacy of God’s Spirit enables the believers to fulfill the Great Commission (Matt. 28:19-20) through demonstrations of the Spirit’s power (Mark 16:15-18; 1 Cor. 2:4-5; 12:4-11) to continue the essence of the gospel of the kingdom (Luke 4:18-19, 43).

⁹ Randy Clark, *Baptized in the Spirit: God’s Presence Resting Upon You with Power* (Shippensburg, PA: Destiny Image Publishers, Inc., 2017), 136-37.

¹⁰ Clark, *Baptized in the Spirit*, 143.

¹¹ Clark, *Baptized in the Spirit*, 145.

¹² J.I. Packer, “The Empowered Christian Life,” in J.I. Packer et al., *The Kingdom and the Power*, eds. Gary S. Greig and Kevin N. Springer (Ventura, CA: Regal Books, 1993), 207.

Third Wave proponents have an expectation that God will demonstrate his power to heal, deliver, restore, comfort, provide guidance, and many other kinds of manifestations of the Holy Spirit. I have experienced the kingdom of God come upon me in power and I have witnessed God heal cancer through prayer and the laying on of hands. It was the Holy Spirit, through my hands, that healed. I have also received personal healing on numerous occasions, of which I will note two: hypothyroidism and endometriosis. In both instances, the Holy Spirit spoke his word to a believer, and the power of God to heal was released. Though I felt nothing at the time of the healings, both were medically verified.

Experiences like this are common in this renewal movement because there is such an emphasis on hearing the Holy Spirit and allowing his power to accomplish his will. Jesus is the model, who healed the sick and cast out demonic spirits (Matt. 8:14-16; Mark 1:19-34; Luke 4:38-41). We follow his example, and the kingdom of God comes by the power of the Holy Spirit. Paul expresses his experience of the empowered demonstration of the gospel declaring God accomplished signs and wonders through him, by the power of the Holy Spirit (Rom. 15:18-19).

Some within the Third Wave accept Christ as our model by understanding the kenotic view of the Incarnation. The kenotic view is an orthodox view because the full deity of Christ is upheld, while understanding that Jesus's Incarnation included a self-limiting of his divine power. Jesus was conceived by the Spirit (Matt. 1:20) and filled with the Spirit at his baptism (Matt. 3:16) to perform healings, miracles, and deliverances by the power of the Spirit. As such, he is our model since we are born of the Spirit when

we believe and confess with our tongue (Rom. 10:9), and then also receive the filling of the Holy Spirit to perform the supernatural works of God (Acts 1:5).

However, some, such as Clark, uphold the traditional view of the Incarnation, that Jesus performed supernatural works of healing and miracles in his divine power.¹³ This view does not lessen the model of Christ for the believer. Both views understand that it is Christ's Spirit, his divinity, that performs supernatural works. For example, in a lecture discussing the gifts of the Spirit, Clark explains that Third Wave theology comprehends God's gifts similar to the Eastern Orthodox Church teaching on *deification*. Deification is becoming more like God by "His grace or divine energies.... We become, as St. Peter writes, 'partakers of the divine nature' (1:4)," which is to know God by his *energies*.¹⁴ The Spirit of Jesus, the Holy Spirit, empowers the believer to become like Christ and to advance the kingdom of God through his power (Col. 1:29).¹⁵ With both views it is Jesus

¹³ I will note with greater detail in the full dissertation that Clark's view has changed.

¹⁴ Randy Clark, "Renewal Theology 2," doctoral lecture for the DMin and ThD, semester 1, in Mechanicsburg, PA, November 13, 2023.

¹⁵ Randy Clark, Session 3 – Third Wave Distinctives, lesson video 1, "Christology (Jesus: Our Model for Discipleship, Kenotic and Non-Kenotic Perspectives, and Deliver from Captivity)," DRS8306: Theological Renewal Studies, from Family of Faith/Global Awakening Theological Seminary, August term 2023, retrieved from <https://faithglobal.populiweb.com/router/courseofferings/10735283/lessons/10784038/show>. The Fourth Ecumenical Council, the Council of Chalcedon in 451 reaffirmed Christ's *hypostasis* creating the Chalcedonian Definition of the nature of Christ; "two natures—divine and human—in Christ." Justo L. Gonzalez, *The Story of Christianity, Vol. 1: The Early Church to the Dawn of the Reformation*, rev. & expanded ed. (New York, NY: HarperCollins, 2010), 302-03; Appendix. The Sixth Ecumenical Council, which was the Third Council of Constantinople (680-81) reaffirmed two natures in Christ and two wills and defeated Monothelitism, that Christ had only one will, a divine will. From this council came the traditional kenotic position that Jesus performed his supernatural acts out of his deity. Roger E. Olson, *The Story of Christian Theology: Twenty Centuries of Tradition & Reform* (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Press, 1999), 247-8. For it was that will and not his human will in action for supernatural acts. However, both views are considered Orthodox. Roger E. Olson specifies the kenotic view as orthodox because the Chalcedonian understanding of the hypostatic union is upheld. What is added is the explanation of how these natures coexisted. Roger E. Olson, *The Mosaic of Christian Belief: Twenty Centuries of Unity and Diversity*, 2nd ed. (Downers Grove, IL: IVP Academic, 2016), 243. The kenotic view of the Incarnation accepts that Jesus adopted the limitations of his omnipresence, and the need for food and sleep and adds that Jesus, one in person with both divine and human natures also voluntarily limited his knowledge and power. According to a leading theologian in kenotic Christology, Thomas C. Oden, Jesus restricted his

performing the work of healing, delivering, restoring, and otherwise. Therefore, Christ is our model, and his Spirit performs supernatural works through us.

The supernatural works of the Holy Spirit express the gospel and help to spread the kingdom of God. Third Wave theology understands that Jesus inaugurated the kingdom of God by his death, resurrection, and ascension. Ruthven notes that “Jesus’ central mission in the New Testament is to inaugurate the kingdom ‘in power’ and ‘in word and deed’ (Luke 4:23-27; 24:19). . . . Miracles manifest the essential core activity of his mission: to displace the physical and spiritual ruin of the demonic kingdom by the wholeness of the Kingdom of God.”¹⁶ This is called inaugurated eschatology—the kingdom is *Now Not-Yet*. Morhew explains, “The future kingdom (eschatological) was *inaugurated* through Jesus but is yet to be consummated.”¹⁷

Therefore, according to Romans 1:16, although there is intrinsic power in the message of the gospel, the New Testament directly connects the gospel with the power given by the Holy Spirit, as expressed in Acts 1:8.¹⁸ The Holy Spirit empowers the

divinity and “walked day by day in radical dependence upon God the Spirit...[who] did not walk or speak by his own independent human power, but by the power of the Spirit.” Thomas C. Oden, *Life in the Spirit Systematic Theology*, Vol. 3, 1st ed. (San Francisco, CA: Harper & Row, 1992), 47, <https://thetdl.on.worldcat.org/oclc/1026473321>. Moreland is especially helpful to articulate why this is so meaningful as disciples of Christ seek to imitate Christ and model our lives after him (cf. Eph. 5:1). He states, “In imitation of Jesus’ ministry, the church is invited to exercise the miraculous power of the Spirit in the service of the Kingdom.” J.P. Moreland, *Kingdom Triangle* (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 2007), 174. In both models, it is the Spirit of Jesus, the divinity of Jesus, performing the supernatural works.

¹⁶ Jon Mark Ruthven, *On the Cessation of the Charismata: The Protestant Polemic on Post-Biblical Miracles*, rev. & expanded ed. (Tulsa, OK: Word & Spirit Press, 2011), 100-01.

¹⁷ Derek Morhew, *Demonstrating the Kingdom: Tools for Christian Discipleship* (Cape Town, South Africa: Vineyard International Publishing, 2019), 18, Kindle. This is a positive eschatological view in line with victorious amillennialism or a balanced postmillennial view. Third Wave proponents predominantly reject dispensational premillennialism.

¹⁸ The book of Acts are the acts of the Holy Spirit who gives power and authority to the disciples of Christ. The Holy Spirit comes in supernatural manifestations to heal, deliver, and otherwise to express the gospel as it is shared. Packer provides an extensive list of New Testament passages that reveal the miraculous aspects of the Holy Spirit accompany the sharing of the gospel revealing a normative

church for ministry as described in Luke 4:14-19 and Matthew 4:23 as “Jesus went throughout Galilee, teaching in their synagogues, proclaiming the good news of the kingdom, and healing every disease and sickness among the people.” As kingdom believers, we seek to follow the pattern of Jesus who went about “healing all who [were] under the power of the devil” (Acts 10:38).

Destroying the works of the devil is the fulfillment of the prophetic mission of Jesus to destroy captivity (Luke 4:16-19), redeem us (Matt. 20:28), and position us as victors with him (Eph. 2:6).¹⁹ This is a vital aspect of the Atonement, which is related to the Christus Victor theory. According to Colossians 2:15, Jesus disarmed the ranks and hierarchies of the demonic realm and “rescued us from the dominion of darkness and brought us to the kingdom of the Son he loves...” (Col. 1:13).²⁰

Furthermore, through the Atonement, there is forgiveness of sins *and* healing of the body. Stated best by Clark, “If we discern what he did through his blood shed on the

expectation of every believer sharing the gospel. “(Matt. 4:23; 9:35, 36; 10:1, 7, 8; 11:5; 12:15, 18; 15:30; 19:2 (cf. Mark 10:1); 21:14 (cf. Luke 21:37); Mark 1:38, 39; 2:2, 11; 3:14, 15; 6:12, 13; 10:1 (cf. Matt. 19:2); Luke 4:18; 5:17, 24; 6:6-11, 17, 18; 7:22; 9: 1, 2; 10:9, 13; 13:10-13, 22, 32; 14:4, 7ff; 21:37 (cf. Matt. 21:14); 16:15-18, 20; John 3:2; 7: 14, 15, 21-23, 31, 38; 10:25, 32, 38; 12:37, 49; 14:10, 12; Acts 1:1; 2:22; 3:6, 12; 4:29, 30; 5:12-16, 20, 21, 28, 42; 6:8, 10; 8:4-7, 12; 9:17-18 (cf. 22:13), 34, 35; 10:38; 14:3, 8-10, 15ff; 15:12, 36; 18:5, 11 (cf. 2 Cor. 12:12; 1 Cor. 2:4, 5); 19:8-12; Rom. 15:18, 19; 1 Cor. 2:4, 5; 11:1; 12:1-11, 28-31; 14:22-25; 2 Cor. 12:12; Gal. 3:5; Phil. 4:9; 1 Thess. 1:5, 6; Heb. 2:3, 4; 6:1, 2; James 5:13-16).” Packer et. al., *The Kingdom and the Power*, 360.

¹⁹ Randy Clark, *Destined for the Cross: 16 Reasons Jesus Had to Die* (Nashville, TN: Thomas Nelson, 2020), 51-63. Clark lists sixteen reasons for the death of Christ, which all relate to the Atonement. Clark’s addition to the “Ransom Theory” is that Jesus did not pay the ransom to any, he was simply the ransom paid much as a soldier who gives his life to save others serves as a ransom as “the cost of war.” Clark, *Destined for the Cross*, 56.

²⁰ For some, but a rare few, the victory of Christ over the powers and authorities of demonic hierarchy and the devil provides a basis for the practice of strategic level spiritual warfare (SLSW). The prevalence of Third Wave adherents, however, simply expect and experience that Christ’s victory enables ground level spiritual warfare, as the commissions to the disciples clearly expect (Mark 6:6-7; Luke 9:1-5; Matt. 10:1, 5-8. See also Acts 8:7; 16:18; 19:12). Clark explains more of SLSW in *Destined for the Cross*, chapter four.

Cross but don't discern the value of his body given for us, then we won't appropriate all that is available to us through the Cross. The benefits of his death are not an either/or choice, but a both/and."²¹ Clark also highlights an additional aspect of the Atonement: so that Jesus could baptize in the Holy Spirit—first for salvation and then for empowerment to minister the gospel with the baptism of the Spirit (Acts 1:8).²²

The occurrence of baptism of the Holy Spirit is understood to come in waves, distinctive from classical Pentecostalism, evangelicalism, and some charismatics. Notably, there is diversity in the timing of the baptism of the Holy Spirit. Clark's lecture explains that the New Testament reveals subsequence as more prevalent, but that is not the only model in Acts nor experienced throughout the church today. In Acts 2:4 the disciples are filled with the Spirit, which is after their conversion event of John 20:22. Yet, they are given an additional infilling, or wave, in Acts 4:31. Clark notes that Cornelius and his household receive the Holy Spirit at conversion; this is not a subsequent filling because Acts 11:13-14 states that the angel told Cornelius to call for Peter who would "bring you a message through which you and all your household *will be saved*."²³ This passage is a baptism of the Spirit at the time of conversion.

In Acts 19:1-7 Paul asks, "Did you receive the Holy Spirit *when you believed?*" (italics mine). This indicates that it is possible to receive at the time of conversion, and

²¹ Clark, *Destined for the Cross*, 10.

²² Clark, *Destined for the Cross*, 71.

²³ Randy Clark, Session 3 – Third Wave Distinctives, lesson video 6, "Pneumatology 1, Part 1: The Baptism of the Holy Spirit," DRS8306: Theological Renewal Studies, from Family of Faith/Global Awakening Theological Seminary, August term 2023, retrieved from <https://faithglobal.populiweb.com/router/courseofferings/10735283/lessons/10784038/show>; Clark, *Baptized in the Spirit*, 100; Clark, *Baptized in the Spirit*, 55. Italics mine.

verse six reveals an explicit doctrine of subsequence. Third Wave theology accepts the diversity in the book of Acts and the testimony throughout church history. Tongues are a sign of the baptism but not *the sign*.

The Holy Spirit is *the gift* and the one who “distributes” his gifts (1 Cor. 12:4b), both situational and constituted. Paul teaches that not all are apostles, prophets, teachers, or gifted with healing, which is the language of a constituted gift (1 Cor. 12:29-30).²⁴ Paul also seamlessly states that he desires all to speak in tongues (1 Cor. 14:5) and to seek to prophesy as it builds the church (1 Cor. 13:12), indicating that a believer can have more than one gift. Clark also notes that in Mark 11:22, Jesus speaks of having the “faith of God,” which Paul speaks of in 1 Corinthians 13:2: The gift of faith can be situational, empowering the believer to pray “without any doubt,” as Jesus states.²⁵ Situational giftings are often contingent upon hearing the Father’s will and the Holy Spirit.

Wimber taught that gifts of the Spirit “are God’s supernatural expressions of love, caring, kindness, healing, and concern—bestowed upon us and through us.”²⁶ Clark explains that the gifts are God’s *charisms*, freely given *graceletes* of service given by the

²⁴ Randy Clark, Session 3 – Third Wave Distinctives, lesson video 1, “Pneumatology 1, Part 2: The Baptism in the Holy Spirit (The Holy Spirit Activates Gifts within Christians—both Situational and Constituted),” DRS8306: Theological Renewal Studies, from Family of Faith/Global Awakening Theological Seminary, August term 2023, retrieved from <https://faithglobal.populiweb.com/router/courseofferings/10735283/lessons/10784038/show>.

²⁵ Clark, “Pneumatology 1, Part 2: The Baptism in the Holy Spirit (The Holy Spirit Activates Gifts within Christians—both Situational and Constituted).” The gift of faith as understood in Mark 11:22 is explained best by Clark in, “A Study on the Effects of Christian Prayer on Pain or Mobility Restrictions from Surgeries Involving Implanted Materials,” (DMin diss., United Theological Seminary, 2013), 51-69. Clark expands on Charles S. Price’s understanding of the gift of faith in *The Real Faith*. The power to heal and the faith to understand the will of God are part of the Holy Spirit’s empowerment. We are all given a measure of faith (Rom. 12:3), but often healing and the miraculous come as a gift of faith as seen in Mark 11:22 and again in Paul’s mention of moving mountains in the gift passage of 1 Corinthians 12-14 (see 13:2).

²⁶ John Wimber and Kevin Springer, *Power Points* (New York, NY: HarperCollins Publishers, 1991), 159.

Holy Spirit as “tangible expression[s] of God’s grace in a person’s life in the form of a capacity to act in a way that surpasses human power.”²⁷ Therefore, a word of knowledge gift of the Spirit (1 Cor. 12:8) that reveals the Father’s will to heal is “God himself imparting to us a grace by empowerment.”²⁸ The same is true of all gifts.

God’s Spirit causes sanctification of the believer, gives the power of God to heal the sick, raise the dead, free captives, and hear and obey the voice of the Father as Jesus did.²⁹ Disciples of Christ are to fulfill the Great Commission (Matt. 28:19-20) empowered by the Holy Spirit (Acts 1:8; 2:4; Col. 1:29). For this reason, equipping the saints in the ways of God is a crucial Third Wave focus. The Ascension gifts, or *doma*, of Ephesians 4 are the fivefold ministry gifts that are given to help care for, train, and “equip his people for works of service....” (4:12-13). The *doma* gifts did not cease but are functional gifts needed by the church, which have and will continue until the *Parousia*.³⁰

²⁷ Randy Clark and Mary Healy, *The Spiritual Gifts Handbook: Using Your Gifts to Build the Kingdom* (Bloomington, MN: Chosen Books, 2018), 24.

²⁸ Randy Clark, “Renewal Theology 1,” doctoral lecture for the DMin and ThD, semester 1, in Mechanicsburg, PA, November 13, 2023; St. Athanasius Academy of Orthodox Theology, “Deification,” article in *The Orthodox Study Bible* (Printed in China: Thomas Nelson, 2008), 1692. However, it is noteworthy to also indicate the now and not-yet aspect of healing. Healing is expected but it is not always given and this is a mystery.

²⁹ 1 Corinthians 6:11; Colossians 1:29; Matthew 10:8; John 5:19.

³⁰ Jon Mark Ruthven, *On the Cessation of the Charismata: The Protestant Polemic on Post-Biblical Miracles*, rev & expanded ed. (United States of America: Word & Spirit Press, 2012), 195-219. This paper is not a polemic to defend the continuation of the offices of apostle and prophet, or the additional *charismata*, gifts of the Spirit. Ruthven’s book is the modern-day polemic against B.B. Warfield’s *Counterfeit Miracles*, and as such, all other adherents to this cessationist position. Ruthven systematically proves that the arguments against any of the modern-day office of the apostle, prophet, or other *charismata*, including the *doma* gifts in Ephesians 4 is unbiblical. For more, please see Ruthven.

The Apostolic Nature of Dr. Randy Clark

Concept of “Apostolic Authority”

The *doma* gifts are called ministry gifts, in that God has ordained certain men and women to lead and equip the Body of Christ. The *doma* gifts differ from the *charismatic* gifts in 1 Corinthians 12:8- 10, Romans 12:4- 8, and 1 Peter 4:10- 11. They are also different from the types of ministries that every believer should be involved in. “Are all apostles? Are all prophets? Are all teachers? Do all work miracles? Do all have gifts of healing? Do all speak in tongues? Do all interpret?” (1 Cor. 12:29-30). All Christians are expected to teach unbelievers or believers at some point, but not all are teachers. All believers are called to prophesy (1 Cor. 14:1), but not all become prophets.

Morphew notes that the Ephesians 4 list simply states that Christ ἔδωκεν “gave” “*the* apostles, *the* prophets, *the* evangelists, and *the* pastors and teachers” (4:11), meaning that the *person* is the gift.³¹ Christ has given leadership gifts to equip the church “until we all reach unity in the faith and in the knowledge of the Son of God and become mature, attaining to the whole measure of the fullness of Christ” (4:13). Clinton E. Arnold’s commentary, *Ephesians*, notes that the final prepositional phrase found within Ephesians 4:11-16 “‘for the building up’ (4:12c)—corresponds exactly to the final phrase of this section (4:16c) and thus forms another inclusio, which expresses the ultimate goal of

³¹ Morphew, *Demonstrating the Kingdom*, 288.

ministry.”³² Arnold also specifies the use of the “intensifying pronoun (αὐτὸς),” which Paul uses to define that Christ is the giver of these gifted individuals. The gifted person serves the saints by helping them conduct ministry according to their own giftings and abilities given by the Holy Spirit.³³ Christ has given leadership gifts to equip the church “until we all reach unity in the faith and in the knowledge of the Son of God and become mature, attaining to the whole measure of the fullness of Christ” (4:13). The *doma* gifts are uniquely anointed persons whom the Lord uses to benefit the Body of Christ.

When speaking of the office of the apostle, Clark’s teaching ubiquitously affirms that the ongoing ministry of the apostolic is utterly separate from the Twelve and Paul, whose ministries are unparalleled and can never be repeated.³⁴ The New Testament use of the word apostle is evident in this distinction—most often referring to the Twelve and Paul, with a secondary reference to at least twenty-two other apostles (see Matt. 10:2-4; Mark 6:30; Luke 6:13; Acts 1:24-26; Rev. 21:14 and compare to Acts 4:36; 14:14; Eph. 4:8, 11-12; 1 Cor. 12:28; Gal. 1:18-19; Rom. 16:7; 1 Thess. 1:1; 2:6).³⁵

³² Clinton E. Arnold, *Ephesians*, Zondervan Exegetical Commentary Series: New Testament (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan Academic, 2010, ePub Edition 2016), 410, Kindle. Arnold specifies Paul’s use of three prepositional phrases and three purpose statements in the chiasmic structure of this passage.

³³ Arnold, *Ephesians*, 426.

³⁴ Randy Clark, *The Essential Guide to the Power of the Holy Spirit: God’s Miraculous Gifts at Work Today* (Shippensburg, PA: Destiny Image, 2015), 77. “I agree that there can never be someone to be in that Twelve and Paul.... no one can be in that.” Randy Clark, Session 4 — New Apostolic Reformation Issues, “Ecclesiology: Third Wave Distinctives (Jesus Gave the 5-Fold Offices to the Church: A Continuationist Perspective,” DRS8306: Theological Renewal Studies, from Family of Faith/Global Awakening Theological Seminary, August term, 2023, retrieved from <https://faithglobal.populiweb.com/router/courseofferings/10735283/lessons/10784040/show>.

³⁵ Randy Clark, *The Essential Guide to the Power of the Holy Spirit: God’s Miraculous Gifts at Work Today* (Shippensburg, PA: Destiny Image Publishers, 2015), 77, (see all of chapter 5); Harold R. Eberle, *Father-Son Theology, Book 2: Biblical Theology Presented in a Systematic Way*, 3rd ed. (Yakima, WA: Worldcast Publishing, 2023), 407.

Of these secondary references, one apostle, Barnabas, is named an apostle with Paul (Acts 14:14) after accepting the commission to go and evangelize (Acts 13:2-4). In Acts 13:2, it is the Holy Spirit who requests that Barnabas and Saul be “set apart” for this commission, a term Paul elsewhere uses for himself (ἀφορίζω) to describe his calling (cf. Rom. 1:1; Gal. 1:15).³⁶ Together with this prophetic call of the Holy Spirit, of which little is said, the Antioch church “sends off” the duo by the laying on of hands (Acts 13:3). Having been sent by the Spirit from Antioch, and later to be called an apostle, Barnabas is a New Testament example of an apostle who is recognized and commissioned both by the Holy Spirit and the church leadership. Barnabas is an apostle who receives what Clark has been known to refer to as a “field promotion,” in that his service to the church and obedience to the call eventually leads to advancement in the kingdom, where the term apostle is applied. Though Barnabas does not fit the criteria for an Apostle, as found in Acts 1, the New Testament recognizes him as an apostle. It is in the midst of serving that Barnabas is called an apostle, an important concept.

According to Clark, the modern-day apostolic function is such that if church leadership were a pyramid with apostles at the top, the pyramid must be turned upside down, making the apostolic the servant of the churches.³⁷ The apostolic serves to preach the gospel and equip “God’s people for works of service, so that the Body of Christ may be built up” (Eph. 4:12). They are to be servant of all, not a controller of all.

³⁶ Craig S. Keener, *Acts: An Exegetical Commentary: 3:1-14:28* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Publishing Group, 2013), 1994, <http://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/dtl/detail.action?docID=3117405>.

³⁷ Randy Clark, “Renewal Theology 4,” doctoral lecture for the DMin and ThD, semester 1, in Mechanicsburg, PA, November 14, 2023, 10:01am.

However, Geivett and Pivec have made false accounts and used misleading language regarding Clark's New Testament apostolic doctrines, convictions, and behaviours. The language choices used in their arguments can be confusing and lead readers to believe in their authority as authors. However, their arguments approach gaslighting with convincing narratives and abased broad-stroke applications to anyone they consider to be part of the New Apostolic Reformation (NAR).³⁸ Their guilt by association approach is difficult to accept since they take the worst examples and apply them liberally to their categorization for who is NAR. They have thus created a fictitious Randy Clark. This has brought harm to the Body of Christ in the form of deception, confusion, a destruction of unity, a misrepresentation of the fivefold nature of Clark's ministry, and more. I will elaborate.

Recently, I stopped in my tracks as I listened to a summary of the so-called NAR teachings where Clark was explicitly named as a "known leader," thereby directly conflating what Pivec considers wrong in the NAR with Clark and his ministry. In this video podcast, Pivec stated the following.

The core teaching... or the leaders of this movement... are claiming to be authoritative apostles and prophets, much like the Old Testament prophets and Christ's Apostles. But they claim that they must hold the highest governing offices in the church so that all other Christians, including even pastors and elders, must submit to them and their authority. And the reason is that, so all Christians can receive their new revelations that they claim to be given. These are revelations that will allegedly equip all Christians to develop supernatural powers like prophesying, healing the sick, raising the dead... even, they will say, even working greater miracles than Jesus worked. The idea is so that the church can rise up as this end times miracles working army to bring heaven to earth, or to bring God's kingdom to earth. And they will say that that is really the Great Commission, and that the reason the church hasn't been able to complete the Great Commission for these past couple thousand years is because apostles and

³⁸ The name of this "movement" was coined by C. Peter Wagner but Geivett and Pivec have made the term unfavorable and negative.

prophets haven't been recognized and so they need to be restored to the church, they need to hold the highest governing offices.... Randy Clark is a well-known apostle in this movement....³⁹

These incredulous words stupefy me because they sound like an insidious attack on Clark's ministry, which has been proven time and again to be mightily used by God. Geivett and Pivec also write, "The main NAR teaching about apostles, which sets the movement apart from the views of other Christians, is that they must govern the church."⁴⁰ The apostolic nature of Clark does carry an authority, discussed in detail below. But he has **never** forced his governance on anyone, demanded submission as a "litmus test of their submission to God," or to "unify the church-army," nor taught that "those who do not submit [to apostles] are seen as rebels against God."⁴¹ However, Clark is consistently depicted as someone who supports and leads these questionable claims.

I find myself deeply disconcerted by the array of accusations leveled against Clark for the following reasons. First, whether from the pulpit or a college, master's, or doctoral level course, Clark has never taught hint or semblance of what Pivec stated in that video, and what she and Geivett write about him. Second, I have never read anything Clark has written that could match these false words. Third, in my capacity as one of Clark's teaching assistants since 2020, I have consistently found his demeanor to be devoid of any suggestion of authoritarianism, let alone an expectation of submission. On

³⁹ Redeeming Truth Podcast, "EP 109 | The Truth About the NAR w/ Holly Pivec and Doug Geivett | Redeeming Truth," May 17, 2023, YouTube video, 5:01, posted by Redeemer Bible Church AZ, <https://youtu.be/tXDq59eqtwg?si=fllktDFCouxJtA1>.

⁴⁰ R. Douglas Geivett and Holly Pivec, *A New Apostolic Reformation?: A Biblical Response to the Worldwide Movement*, (Bellingham, WA: Lexham Press, 2014), <https://thetl.on.worldcat.org/oclc/1055044424>, 8.

⁴¹ R. Douglas Geivett and Holly Pivec, *God's Super-Apostles: Encountering the Worldwide Prophets and Apostles Movement* (Bellingham, WA: Lexham Press, 2018), 18; 22; 85, Kindle.

the contrary, I have encountered and believed the opposite, while experiencing invaluable exposure and understanding of his pedagogical approaches and theological tenets. Clark does not control or demand submission but provides freedom and gives respect to everyone around him. Geivett and Pivec are combining conflicting facts and are responsible for not only reaching unjustified conclusions about Clark's apostolic character and practices but also spreading their conflating ideas as if they are unquestionable truths.

In a lecture to ThD and DMin students on November 14, 2023, Clark explicitly explains what authority the leadership team of the Apostolic Network of Global Awakening (ANGA) carries.⁴² Clark states about ANGA, "We are not even like the bishops of a liturgical setup. If there is a need, the bishop can turn people out of buildings. That is power. But in ANGA, we can only give suggestions and advice when there are issues."⁴³ This advice can be received or not, submission is never required. In fact, this is also made clear in the ANGA welcome package that is sent to new members of the network—there is no requirement for submission stated or insinuated. Tithing is also not required, though there is a \$30 per month administrative fee (or \$360 per year) accompanied by a "welcome to the family" message.

When I interviewed Clark and asked for more information about the practices of ANGA, he shared with me his intention to disclose his declaration of faith—to enable

⁴² Randy Clark is the president and founder of Global Awakening and the Apostolic Network of Global Awakening. More information about the network is available online, <https://globalawakeningnetwork.com/>.

⁴³ Randy Clark, "Renewal Theology 4," doctoral lecture for the DMin and ThD, semester 1, in Mechanicsburg, PA, November 14, 2023. "Issues" relates to what any denomination would seek to bring reconciliation to such as heresy or "unrepentance for very serious moral issues." Randy Clark, interviewed by the author in a semi-structured format, Mechanicsburg, PA, November 16, 2023, 46:12; 47:16.

prospective participants of ANGA to discern their inclination towards establishing an affiliation with the network.⁴⁴ Sharing theology expresses beliefs, Christian praxis, and the system of values for individuals and organizations. The sharing of Clark's statement of faith is not given as a "thou must believe" requirement but it is given so that the reader can determine if they agree with enough to want to participate in ANGA. He said, "You don't have to agree with all of it. Just the parts that are the essence of Christianity. Like Jesus is the Savior; you are saved by faith and grace through faith. That part you must believe. But you know, my view on other things, you don't have to agree with me. I just want you to know what I believe."⁴⁵ ANGA consists of Christians from many different belief systems and backgrounds. For example, there are Calvinists, Arminians, Catholics, Presbyterians, Pentecostals, those from the Holiness camp, and others. To demand obedience to a specific ideal, theology, or praxis would not fit. But common ground is found in Jesus the Lord and the ecumenism of his Holy Spirit.

Within the network, Clark will share what he and others believe God desires the church to do in a season, which "are the Scriptural values and priorities, of course," impressed on their hearts.⁴⁶ But these are not instructions, which require obedience. Moreover, the validity of whether what is shared are truly from the Lord are measured by the fruit of following where God leads. For example, are there increased salvations, healings, or church growth? These indicate that God orchestrated the direction and

⁴⁴ Clark, interview, 33:11.

⁴⁵ Clark, interview, 34:11. The ANGA page states, "We are a *family* of ministry leaders, pastors, and missionaries connected through *relationship* to accomplish *more together* than we can alone (italics mine).

⁴⁶ Clark, interview, 34:11.

provided the fruit. So, Clark shares what he and others believe is God's guidance, but these are not directives or orders, and submission is not required.

Clark made this very clear in our interview numerous times. Because I knew that he has been accused of demanding submission, I asked him about it quite blatantly to receive a clear response. When I asked, "Do you expect anybody in the Apostolic Network of Global Awakening to walk in submission to your directives, requests, anything?" Clark responded with a tone of patience and hand gestures that were working to explain his meaning as he said, "No, I don't.... Because I believe I don't have the right to tell people what they are supposed to do."⁴⁷ I know personally that this is Clark's true and consistent manner. He has never demanded a specific behavior or that any of his instructions are followed. Clark believes that since God does not touch our "choosers," but allows diversity and choice, it is important to follow God's example.

In a follow-up question, I asked Clark about the concept of aligning with ANGA or any of his beliefs. Since Clark is accused of using euphemisms such as "alignment" as a code to hide terms like submission, it was important to get clarity on this from him directly. I asked, "Is alignment a euphemism as a term? So that, when you say 'alignment,' you actually mean 'submission'?" In response, Clark shook his head and looked up to the ceiling with that same kindness and compassion that his demeanor and tone carried throughout the interview. He said, "I really don't like the term submission because I don't like the power. It can be manipulative, and it can be abusive. And if I have a weakness, it's the opposite. I give people so much freedom to do what they feel

⁴⁷ Clark, interview, 32:08.

like, show, and believe, and they don't have to agree with me.”⁴⁸ As someone who works for Clark as a teaching assistant, this is a truth that I have experienced. Clark works to give honor, freedom, and loving guidance.

However, Geivett and Pivec misrepresent Clark's statements and manipulate the meaning of his words. For example, on a Remnant Radio discussion, Clark says, “The apostolic networks that I have interviewed, almost all of them have no legal power to control, at all. It's all *relational*.”⁴⁹ This is like what Clark shares above, and the meaning is explicit—he seeks relational unity in Christ. But his words and meaning are twisted and called a euphemism by Pivec and Geivett to allegedly hide “the way that relational dynamics can actually be exploited for authoritarian purposes, and it ignores the fact that apostles and prophets do exercise unique authority. So stressing the relational aspect does nothing to alleviate concerns about the presumed authority of an apostle.”⁵⁰ We agree that exploiting anyone for authoritarian purposes is wrong and an abuse of power. However, twisting Clark's words to fit another meaning is not just a distortion of reality and the facts but it is also an ungodly attack on Clark's true meaning and character.

⁴⁸ Clark, interview, 38:33. Geivett and Pivec claim that “alignment is code for submission. NAR leaders teach frequently about the need for all Christians, including pastors, to be properly ‘aligned’ with—or submitted to—the fivefold ministry leaders, especially the apostles and prophets.” Pivec and Geivett, *Counterfeit Kingdom*, 74-76. Global Awakening is listed as one of the apostolic networks on this page and this is an unfair accusation, here proven categorically untrue—alignment is not a term used by Clark to hide any form of a submission requirement.

⁴⁹ The Remnant Radio, “The NAR Debate! Randy Clark Responds to Dr. Doug Geivett and Holly Pivec,” You Tube, April 19, 2022, 18:26, <https://www.youtube.com/live/Bz8yCZXjH7I?si=vUqXgeXGZt2FVdxm>. Emphasis mine.

⁵⁰ Holly Pivec and R. Douglas Geivett, *Counterfeit Kingdom: The Dangers of New Revelation, New Prophets, and New Age Practices in the Church* (Brentwood, TN: B&H Publishing Group, 2022), <https://thetdtl.on.worldcat.org/oclc/1351200886>, 77-78. They list the Remnant Radio interview in their footnote.

Clark is not naïve to suggest that some who claim to be apostolic do not abuse authority or that authoritarian abuse does not happen. To the contrary, he states, “Have I met some that have abused? Yes, I have. But I have had a lot of pastors that did that, too.... What it really is for me is that we have a relationship.”⁵¹ When Clark uses the word relationship, he is not employing a euphemism to hide reality—he is speaking truthfully. If there are leaders within what Geivett and Pivec consider the NAR abusing authority, Clark is not one of them.

Moreover, to utilize various “true” stories that allegedly relate to NAR leaders and place these downfalls on *every* NAR apostle and prophet, is the literal textbook definition of a straw man—some of these stories might be true, but that does not make them accurate for everyone. No one would ever say, “Because Pentecostals believe in the subsequent baptism of the Holy Spirit and Pentecostals are Protestants, then all Protestants believe and teach this.” That is nonsense.⁵²

Though Clark is not guilty of utilizing the euphemism the critics claim he is using, he does have a metaphor in his teaching that helps to explain the kingdom value of servant leadership. The metaphor does not hide a truth—it expresses the role of any Christian leader, especially those with an apostolic function. Clark calls this metaphor “the towel.” In John 13:3-5, part of the Upper Room discourse, John writes,

Jesus knew that the Father had put all things under his power, and that he had come from God and was returning to God; so, he got up from the meal, took off his outer clothing, and wrapped a towel around his waist. After that, he poured

⁵¹ Clark, interview, 28:12.

⁵² Dr. Michael Brown discusses this approach of using broad brush strokes to lump all who are believed to be part of the NAR belief structure into one category. This interview is worthy to be watched for more on this topic. Please see “Dr. Michael Brown Responds: Can We Lock Arms with NAR Critiques,” The Remnant Radio, YouTube video, retrieved January 28, 2024, https://youtu.be/WD4egOuFNT8?si=aVwCSGdtnqwgw_hf.

water into a basin and began to wash his disciples' feet, drying them with the towel that was wrapped around him.

In this passage, Jesus assumes the role of a servant, who would typically be tasked with washing the feet of those present. According to Keener, "Washing feet was a menial task, and one who sought to wash another's feet normally took the posture of a servant or dependent."⁵³ But it was not just the menial task of the service that Keener notes worthy of consideration to comprehend the message of the washing. It also relates to the position Jesus needed to adopt. Keener explains that the ancient etiquette required the leader to be mindful of the rank of those attending a dinner, which was often established by gifts, and that placement around this reclining custom usually had the most honored guest in the most prominent place. Jesus washed his disciples' feet (the gift) equally, thereby removing rank, and he removed himself from the place of honor, coming away from the table, standing, not reclining, taking the position of the servants.⁵⁴

Jesus assumed the opposite of one having authority for an object lesson in humility and selfless service. In the same way, Clark teaches doctoral students, saying,

In John 13, he [Jesus] is showing them the most important thing to have power—it is to have love. He says to them, "Do you understand what I have done to you?" What is apostolic ministry to be like? A servant's heart motivated by love. This is to be the motivation; this is how you are supposed to be known. Not by wielding great power but by laying aside your outer garment. Being known as a servant. A

⁵³ Craig S. Keener, *The Gospel of John: A Commentary* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2003), <https://thetdl.on.worldcat.org/oclc/853278535>, 904.

⁵⁴ Keener, *The Gospel of John*, 900-07. Keener also notes that because this passage relates to the impending crucifixion, there is a correlation that willingness to serve also means serving to the point of death. Additionally, Morris notes because Jesus states, "Now that I, your Lord and Teacher, have washed your feet, you also should wash one another's feet" (v. 14), there is an idea that the concept of greatness among disciples is tied directly to lowly acts of service such as this. Leon Morris, *The Gospel According to John*, rev. ed., The New International Commentary on the New Testament (Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 1995), <https://thetdl.on.worldcat.org/oclc/32465455>, 551.

symbol of authority would have been worn back then as your outer garment. But Jesus took that off and was a slave to them.⁵⁵

Clark's view is clear—the apostolic relates to Christ's model in John 13. Jesus also describes himself as a servant (Mark 10:45) and models perfect servanthood in his Incarnation, the washing of the disciples' feet, obedience to the will of the Father (Luke 22:42), and ultimately in his death (Matt. 20:26-38). Jesus' servanthood is the emphasis of Third Wave theology and praxis, making Matthew 20:25-28 another critical passage for the movement. All disciples of Christ are to model their behavior after him, not leading like those who lord over others but by being sacrificial servants.

Jesus introduced this radical idea to explain his servant leadership, which is like the inverted pyramid Clark teaches. Jesus also expresses this idea in Matthew 20:27. Keener explains that most masters at the time of Christ did not believe their “slaves were theoretically equals,” let alone believe in a new standard that made the leader the most excellent servant of all.⁵⁶ By revealing the leadership dynamic that Jesus expects his disciples to follow, he teaches that servanthood is the kingdom's way to measure greatness (Matt. 20:20-28; Mark 10:35-37; Luke 22:24-27). Servant leadership is the basis of Clark's theology and praxis. He has given his life to the furtherance of the gospel and to help educate, train, and equip believers that the gifts of the Holy Spirit “are not

⁵⁵ Randy Clark, “Renewal Theology, 3” doctoral lecture for the DMin and ThD, semester 1, in Mechanicsburg, PA, November 13, 2023. Clark continues to use this euphemism, “wear the towel, not the authority” throughout the weeklong “Doctoral Intensives,” for which he taught twelve of the sessions.

⁵⁶ Craig S. Keener, *The IVP Bible Background Commentary: New Testament* (Downers Grove, IL: IVP Academic, 2014), 100.

just for specially qualified people or extraordinarily holy people. They are for every member of the Body of Christ, every ‘little ole me.’”⁵⁷

Serving the Lord Jesus as a minister to the churches is nothing like the broad and negative strokes Geivett and Pivec have painted all NAR apostles with. Clark was emphatic when he stated,

Geivett and Pivec talk about submission all the time. They continue to claim [things such as] “These apostles and prophets teach that being in submission gives special access to apostolic or prophetic powers.” **I totally disagree with that. I don’t believe....** I don’t speak for everybody in the world, as I don’t speak for all pastors. I am not speaking for all people who are apostolic or for people who claim they are apostles. I am not speaking for everybody. But in a circle that I know well, I am speaking of me and of them.... They’re not commanding submission, demanding submission. They don’t talk about it. They talk about relationships. So, to say, “You have to submit to me.” We actually can’t! Legally, for most of us, and for my network of churches and ministries, I have no legal right over them at all. I can’t take them out of their churches. I can’t move them. I can appeal to them like Paul appealed. And where I do feel like I’ve had most authority was in the church I started. My wife and I didn’t know a soul, went to St. Louis and started a church. In that church, we were mother and father.... They were our living epistles, you know, their transformed lives was the evidence of God in our lives.⁵⁸

The natural question to follow is, if not top-down governance, what is the influence and authority of the modern-day New Testament apostle? Apostolic authority relates primarily to the ministry *they have received* from the Lord, and not everyone is the same. Jesus is the One sent by his Father (Heb. 3:1) who in turn commissioned his Twelve (Matt. 10:1-4; Mark 3:13-19; Luke 6:12-16) and many others (Luke 10:1-23).⁵⁹

⁵⁷ Randy Clark and Mary Healy, *The Spiritual Gifts Handbook: Using Your Gifts to Build the Kingdom* (Bloomington, MN: Chosen Books, 2018), 18-19.

⁵⁸ Clark, interview, 25:53, emphasis mine.

⁵⁹ The Gospel of John describes Jesus as sent by the Father in 3:34; 4:34; 5:23-24, 30, 36-38; 6:29, 38-39, 44, 57; 7:16, 28-29, 33; 8:16, 18, 26, 29, 42; 9:4; 10:36; 11:42; 12:44-45, 49; 13:30; 14:24; 15:21; 16:5; 17:3, 8, 18, 21, 23, 25; 20:21.

According to Clark, being called into the apostolic “means that God has sent you, that you have been called to wherever he sends you, and that you will often be used in activating or imparting gifts wherever you are sent.”⁶⁰ Clark has been apostolically called and gifted to the Body of Christ as one Jesus has sent to the nations to “lay hands on people to be filled and activated in the gifts of the spirit.”⁶¹

The term ἀπόστολος, “apostle,” refers to one who is “delegated” or “sent.”⁶² According to J. Rodman Williams, Paul mentions the apostles first (Eph. 4:11; 1 Cor. 12:28), which relates to their specific function in equipping the saints.⁶³ Williams also notes that Christ patterned his selection of apostles on earth (Luke 6:12-16), and “so from heaven the exalted Lord continues that ministry first of all through apostolic activity.”⁶⁴ Additionally, Williams brings attention to the *Book of Hebrews*, which declares Jesus as “*the* apostle and high priest of our confession” (3:1, italics mine). “Since Jesus is ‘*the* apostle,’ all others who are called apostles derive their position and authority from him.”⁶⁵ Apostolic authority is not earned or assumed; it is a commissioned delegation of authority and function by Jesus himself.⁶⁶

⁶⁰ Clark, *There is More!*, 32.

⁶¹ Clark, “Ecclesiology: Third Wave Distinctives,” 6:00.

⁶² William D. Mounce, *Mounce’s Complete Expository Dictionary of Old and New Testament Words* (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan Academic, 2006), 26.

⁶³ J. Rodman Williams, *Renewal Theology: Systematic Theology from a Charismatic Perspective*, Three Volumes in One (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan Academic, 1996), 3:165.

⁶⁴ Williams, *Renewal Theology*, 3:165.

⁶⁵ Mounce, *Complete Expository Dictionary*, 27; Williams, *Renewal Theology*, 3:165.

⁶⁶ A. F. Walls, “Apostle,” in J. D. Douglas et al., *New Bible Dictionary*, ed. D. Guthrie, 2nd ed. (Downers Grove, IL: Intervarsity Press, 1994), 59.

Eberle, in his three-volume *Father-Son Theology* series, articulates this by examining Ephesians 4:8, which specifies that the *doma* were given at Christ's *Ascension*. Therefore, 4:11 does not explicitly relate to the apostles, prophets, evangelists, teachers, and pastors "who were active during Jesus' ministry. The ministry gifts referred to in Ephesians 4:11 were given after Jesus died and was resurrected."⁶⁷ Keener agrees with this and adds, "Paul never restricted the use of God's apostles to the Twelve or to the Twelve plus himself (Rom. 16:7; 1 Cor. 15:5-7; Gal. 1:10; compare occasionally even in Acts 1:26; 14:4, 14)." Both Eberle and Keener note that the contextual aspect of Ephesians 4:12-13 imposes a *continuation* of the function of all five ministry gifts "until we all reach unity...attaining to the whole measure of the fullness of Christ," which cannot occur *until the Parousia*.⁶⁸

Moreover, in his textual study of Ephesians 4:11-13, Hoehner securely establishes the continuity of the fivefold ministries. He writes,

Μέχρι καταστήσωμεν οἱ πάντες, 'until we all attain.' Normally μέχρι appears in the NT as a temporal adverb or improper preposition with the genitive meaning "up to the point of." It occurs three times as a conjunction (Mark 13:30; Gal. 4:19; Eph. 4:13) and always with an aorist subjunctive without ἄν to indicate an indefinite future. Used with an aorist subjunctive, it means "*until*, of a punctiliarly conceived future even preceded in time by the action of the main clause."⁶⁹ This conjunction could depend on the immediately preceding prepositional phrase "for the building up of the Body of Christ," but it is more probable that it relates back to ἔδωκεν, "he gave," in verse 11, denoting that he gave gifted individuals to the

⁶⁷ Eberle, *Father-Son Theology*, 408.

⁶⁸ Craig S. Keener, *Gift and Giver: The Holy Spirit for Today* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2001), 127; Eberle, *Father-Son Theology*, 409.

⁶⁹ James Hope Moulton, Nigel Turner, and Wilbert Francis Howard, *Moulton-Howard-Turner Greek Grammar Collection* (No publishing city: T & T Clark), 3:111; Daniel B. Wallace, *Greek Grammar* (No publishing city: Zondervan Academic, 1997), 479-80, quoted by Harold W. Hoehner, *Ephesians: An Exegetical Commentary* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2002), <https://thetdl.on.worldcat.org/oclc/50124936>, 398.

church and that will continue until the action of the following aorist subjunctive *καταντήσωμεν* “until we all attain.”⁷⁰

The fivefold is to continue until we all attain “to the whole measure of the fullness of Christ” (Eph. 4:13), which is the *Parousia*. The entire Body of Christ awaits the eschaton, when Jesus, “the perfect comes” (1 Cor. 13:10, NASB). One of the strongest and greatest voices in support of the continuation of the charismata, including the gifted persons of Ephesians 4:11, is Jon Mark Ruthven. Ruthven links 1 Corinthians 12:28 and Ephesians 4:11 as continuation gifts until the *Parousia* and advances the understanding of the continuation of the apostolic and prophetic considering Ephesians 2:20.

Ruthven also importantly notes the Reformation response to the Roman Catholic right of the Pope to speak *ex-cathedra*, which forced a misconception that modern-day apostles are essential Protestant popes.⁷¹ Ruthven writes,

Part of explosiveness of this issue is that the gift of apostleship is so loaded with Reformation ecclesiastical preconceptions, that rational discussion over continuing apostleship is difficult. One misguided task of Reformation polemics was to shift the aura of ecclesiastical authority from the Pope (the ‘last apostle’) to the apostles of the New Testament.⁷²

To combat this Papal authority, the Reformers determined that “foundation” in Ephesians 2:20 related to the formation of the Canon, thereby quashing the continuation of the apostolic and prophetic fivefold offices. Many modern-day critics against apostolic function believe in this concept of a Protestant pope whose words carry the same

⁷⁰ Hoehner, *Ephesians*, 398.

⁷¹ Jon Mark Ruthven, *On the Cessation of the Charismata: The Protestant Polemic on Post-Biblical Miracles*, revised & expanded ed. (Tulsa, OK: Word & Spirit Press, 2012), 195.

⁷² Ruthven, *On the Cessation*, 195.

authority as the Bible and therefore fight against the use of the term apostle or apostolic.⁷³ However, as will be discussed in detail below, Clark's theology and praxis affirms that modern-day apostles do not have canonical authority because "revelation is never on that level of 'special revelation,' which is the Canon."⁷⁴

According to Ruthven, the foundation referenced in Ephesians 2:20 relates to Peter's confession of Christ, "You are the Messiah, the Son of the living God" (Matt. 6:18). The apostles and prophets are "'foundational' in that they are 'prototypal'" proclaimers of Jesus as the Messiah.⁷⁵ Such examples (the apostles and prophets) must continue until the *Parousia* (Eph. 4:13; 1 Cor. 13:10). Ruthven also argues that Christ's role as the capstone, or cornerstone, as the "whole building is joined together and rises," must also cease to function for the cessationist premise to function.⁷⁶

Ruthven also targets two critical aspects of the cessationist argument. First, the cessationist polemic that 1 Corinthians 15:8 is proof that Paul was to be the last apostle is argued against because Paul is stating he is the least, in that "he was unusually graced by God, despite its inappropriateness and suddenness, to become a witness of the resurrected Lord."⁷⁷ Second, cessationists presuppose that because the biblical Canon is complete,

⁷³ Ruthven, *On the Cessation*, 195.

⁷⁴ Clark, interview, 1:58.

⁷⁵ Ruthven, *On the Cessation*, 198.

⁷⁶ Ruthven, *On the Cessation*, 211-16. Since we know this is not true, the apostles, prophets, and the capstone must continue until the maturation of the Body of Christ. The cessationist premise in this passage is that the foundation was the Scripture writing revelation given to the apostle and prophet. Because the New Testament was completed, the function and role of apostle and prophet was to then cease. However, according to Ruthven for this to be true contextually, the function of Jesus as the capstone, or cornerstone, would also have ceased.

⁷⁷ Ruthven, *On the Cessation*, 199-200.

the role of an apostle is no longer needed, since this is considered a primary apostolic function. Ruthven helpfully notes that though some Apostles of Christ did write Scripture, the actual percentage of written Scripture from the Twelve and Paul to a non-apostle is 59% - 41%, with Paul having written 43% of the 59%; he also highlights that the most prolific writer among the apostles was Paul, who was not one of the Twelve.⁷⁸

Therefore, though one task of an Apostle was to write Scripture, the fact is, this was only one function and non-apostles wrote nearly half of the New Testament. Yes, the Apostles wrote Scripture, and one of the tests of the early church to determine if a book or letter was Scripture was determined by whether it was written by an Apostle, or associate of the Apostle. The Apostolic function of writing Scripture is not in question. However, the point that Ruthven makes is that the cessationist strict connection to the writing of Scripture and the ending of the gift because the Canon is closed is weak.⁷⁹

According to Ephesians 4:11, the continuing function of the apostolic and the fivefold in general is “to equip his people for works of service, so that the body of Christ may be built up” (4:12-13) towards an eschatological unity.⁸⁰ In his commentary on *Ephesians*, R. Schnackenburg notes that Paul’s language in this passage is associated with the *persons* (as mentioned above) versus in 1 Corinthians 12:4-11 where the

⁷⁸ Ruthven, *On the Cessation*, 216-17.

⁷⁹ Ruthven, *On the Cessation*, 216-17. Please read this chapter in Ruthven for more.

⁸⁰ I use the term fivefold even though some, such as Bruce, advocate the use of four-fold, combining pastors and teachers, since teaching cannot be separated from the pastoral role. F. F. Bruce, *The Epistles to the Colossians, to Philemon, and to the Ephesians*, The New International Commentary on the New Testament (Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans Publishing, 1984), 347, Kindle. Also, the concept of eschatological unity must be utterly separated from any form of this concept offered by Geivett and Pivec. Third Wave advocates that I know of, especially who relate to Clark, never speak of the creation of an end-time army that must submit to an apostle. That is nonsense. The unity expressed above is that which Paul speaks of in vv. 1-6. We unite because of our faith in Christ and our knowledge of him (Col. 3:13-14; cf. 1 Tim. 4:9).

diversity of *charismata* are given to *individuals* to minister according to those *charisms*.⁸¹ Still, the apostolic and the prophetic are listed also in 1 Corinthians 12:28, meaning they are part of the expected spiritual gifts that the Body of Christ is given. Ruthven also notes that the apostolic is listed first in Ephesians 4:11 and 1 Corinthians 12:28, perhaps indicating that this is one of the “higher gifts” commanded in 1 Corinthians 12:31 to be “eagerly sought.”⁸²

Hoehner’s commentary, *Ephesians: An Exegetical Commentary*, translates Ephesians 4:12 to read, “for the preparation of the saints for the work of the ministry for the building up of the Body of Christ.”⁸³ Hoehner’s translation allows the reader to better comprehend the *doma*’s purpose. Hoehner also highlights Paul’s use of καταρτισμός, “equipping” as a verb and lists a wide range of its meanings such as “to complete, finish” (LXX, Ezra 73:16), or “to prepare” (Rom. 9:22), “to put into proper order, complete, furnish” (1 Thess. 3:10), “to perfect” (Matt. 21:16) and others.⁸⁴ However, in the context of Ephesians 4:12 καταρτισμός is a noun, which is best understood to include instruction towards an eschatological maturing and unity towards making all of God’s people effective ministers in the church.⁸⁵ As the word relates to τῶν ἁγίων, “the saints,” an objective genitive, there can be no doubt that Paul means that believers are the recipients

⁸¹ Rudolf Schnackenburg, *Ephesians: A Commentary* (Edinburgh, T&T Clark, 1991), 175, <https://thedtl.on.worldcat.org/oclc/1244471296>. Emphasis mine.

⁸² Ruthven, *On the Cessation*, 199.

⁸³ Hoehner, *Ephesians*, 395.

⁸⁴ Hoehner, *Ephesians*, 395-96. LXX is the acronym for Septuagint, the Greek translation of the Old Testament Hebrew text.

⁸⁵ Hoehner, *Ephesians*, 397.

of the gifted persons equipping, and that can only happen with the work of the Holy Spirit (cf. 3:16; 4:3-4; 6:18). Hoehner concludes, “Therefore, gifted persons were given to the church for the immediate purpose of training or preparing believers. It is important to be endowed with the gifts(s) of the Spirit, but it is also important to learn to use the gift(s) effectively in the church for edification.”⁸⁶

The idea emerges of a gifted church filled with believers who need those Christ has gifted to them for the training of their calls to ministry for the church’s growth. This harkens to the Pauline passage in 1 Corinthians 12-14, where the Apostle Paul educates the Corinthians about the gifts and helps lend an understanding of the Holy Spirit’s activity in giving gifts to all and how the gifts relate to one another. The purpose of learning how to operate in the ministry given to each of us is to edify the body and bring unity as we mature (Eph. 4:12-13).

This ministry is the hallmark of Clark’s apostolic function. He has consistently served to equip the saints for the work of ministry throughout his decades of ministry. This equipping is no different than an evangelism class where disciples of Christ learn how to share their faith. But more importantly, Clark’s ministry is associated with the powerful presence and outpouring of the Holy Spirit, as will be discussed below.⁸⁷

⁸⁶ Hoehner, *Ephesians*, 396-97.

⁸⁷ This is my experience. In 2016 I attended a conference with Dr. Clark but I was not aware of his ministry. I knew that he had been reported to have the gift of healing and I needed new hips (I am to be 44 this June and I have a left prosthetic hip with the right hip holding out). Instead of new hips I received multiple baptisms in the Holy Spirit, which I did not have a theology for. On the contrary, I would leave a church with anyone who spoke in tongues or anyone who started to manifest with shaking, or other signs of the touch of the Holy Spirit. Clark’s teaching somehow put faith into me that the touch of the Holy Spirit was God, and as a result I was able to submit myself to the baptism. The fruit of the touch proved to be the Spirit of God in the following months with greater sanctification, enhanced biblical studies, increased boldness to share the gospel, and people being healed when I prayed. This is a very common experience with Clark’s ministry and Jesus is glorified.

Clark's teaching is closely linked with the Holy Spirit, who empowers believers, leaders, and pastors often resulting in the planting of new churches and chains of churches.

Believers better comprehend the *charismata* with a resulting maturation to work with God in these gifts. Clark is also known to help nurture leaders who oversee church networks and aid their spiritual maturity and growth. His ministry is also associated with healings and miracles. Is this function still required today, or has the Body of Christ matured beyond needing the fivefold?

Impartation and Equipping the Saints

What does it mean to equip the saints? The critics claim that apostles, like Clark, teach that they carry special blessings, or revelations, that enable believers to learn how to “do” the miraculous, such as healing the sick. That is nonsense. The concept of impartation is misunderstood as something sinister but untrue. Clark repeatedly emphasizes the sovereignty of the Holy Spirit as the gift giver and the one who stirs the gifts (1 Cor. 12:11).⁸⁸ Impartation and equipping the saints, therefore, go together.

Jesus said he would not leave us as orphans (John 14:17-18) but that he would come to us. Paul tells us that the “Lord is the Spirit” (2 Cor. 3:17) and that those who are united with the Lord are one with him in Spirit (2 Cor. 6:17). These verses express the reality of normative New Testament life—we are to experience Jesus by his Spirit, and the book of Acts makes it clear that we should have an infilling or empowerment event to enhance this reality (Acts 1:8; 2:4; 4:8, 31; 7:55; 8:14-17; 9:17-18; 10:44-46; cf. 11:13-

⁸⁸ Though I will elaborate on impartation, this video is a classic teaching where Clark explicitly emphasizes the Holy Spirit's sovereignty. Randy Clark, “Impartation | Dr. Randy Clark | James River Church,” James River Church, streamed live on March 20, 2023, YouTube video, 27:00 mark, <https://youtu.be/3JrPYVsNbMc?si=KcNw-dupATUpWa1V>.

14; 13:9, 52; 19:1-7).⁸⁹ These texts bear witness to the fact that baptism of the Holy Spirit is often given in the presence of apostles and often by the laying on of hands. Ananias is an exception (Acts 9:17), which indicates God will use whom he chooses. Failure to accept the continuance of this New Testament reality is to limit the Person of the Holy Spirit and treat him as though we do not require more of him today. If the Great Apostle himself went to John the Baptist to receive “the Spirit of God descending like a dove and alighting on him” (Matt. 3:13-17), how much more should we seek to go to those whom God has appointed with this same grace?

The activity of the Holy Spirit, with his baptism of empowerment (whether at conversion or after), is a focus of the New Testament. One example of this emphasis is found in the Second Gospel, where Mark expresses Jesus’s expectation that his disciples share in his ministry. According to Keener in *The Spirit in the Gospels and Acts*, the ministry of Jesus in Mark’s Gospel relates to the baptism of Jesus, which we are called to share (Mark 10:39). Turning to Mark 1:8-13 Keener reveals that the baptism of Jesus is prototypical in Mark’s pneumatology, especially the outcome of that baptism. Keener is elaborating on the knowledge that there are two strands of pneumatology in Judaism, which are the Spirit of prophecy and purity, and necessarily must include the Spirit of empowerment (Mark 16:15-18). The disciples are to be empowered for ministry, especially in defeating Satan through power evangelism and exorcisms (1:12-13; 3:28), as well as enduring suffering, which is associated with carrying one’s own cross (10:38-39; 13:9-13). The Markan trajectory of the Passion throughout his Gospel reveals that the Spirit of prophecy, power, and purity working to manifest God’s kingdom “increases the

⁸⁹ Ruthven, *On the Cessation*, 196.

birth-pangs of the Messiah that must precede the ultimate and full revelation of the kingdom (13:7-13).”⁹⁰ Thus, Keener’s summary aptly states, “Miracle-working and suffering because of the gospel are both inseparable corollaries of union with Christ in Spirit baptism, because baptism declares both Christ’s cross and his glory.”⁹¹ Therefore, all disciples of Christ should be first expecting the Spirit of Christ to empower evangelistic and kingdom efforts, while also expecting there to be suffering associated with carrying one’s cross.

The Apostle Paul consistently focused on the Holy Spirit’s power in his ministry (1 Cor. 2:4; 4:20; Eph. 1:17-20; 3:16-20; Rom. 15:17-19). Gordon Fee explains this critical aspect of Pauline theology, which is a focus on the experiential aspect of the Holy Spirit, proves that God’s presence is among believers. Fee writes of Paul’s concept of power, “The Spirit means the presence of great power, power to overflow with hope (Rom. 15:13), power sometimes attested by signs and wonders and at other times by joy in great affliction.”⁹² This is why the Book of Acts repeatedly focuses on an empowering experience that leads to boldness and power so that “the word the Lord [would] spread widely and [grow] in power” (Acts 19:20).

In Ephesus Paul “placed his hands on them,” as Peter and John had in Samaria, and the “Holy Spirit came on them” (Acts 19:6; 8:14-17; cf. 10:44-48). Paul reminds Timothy to “fan into flame the gift of God, which is in you through the laying on of my

⁹⁰ Craig S. Keener, *The Spirit in the Gospels and Acts: Divine Purity and Power* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 1997), 70.

⁹¹ Keener, *The Spirit in the Gospels and Acts*, 70.

⁹² Gordon D. Fee, *Paul, the Spirit, and the People of God* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 1996), 146.

hands” (2 Tim. 1:6). In the New Testament “impartation of anointing through the laying on of hands was an important catalyst for effective ministry characterized by the manifest presence of God, and for operating in the complete gifts of the Holy Spirit.”⁹³ This apostolic function has not ceased and is a primary way the Lord continues to use Clark. However, this does not mean Clark has ever assumed or taught that he can take what he wants and pass it on to others. Nor is it true that impartation is used to activate gifts in accordance with *Clark’s* will.⁹⁴ Impartation is biblical, holy, and utterly sovereign.

There is a strange concept being taught by Geivett and Pivec about what impartation is. In one of their books, they claim the following: “A key teaching of NAR is that people can learn to work miracles. NAR leaders claim that miraculous gifts can be activated in all those who accept the new truths that are being taught by present-day apostles and prophets.”⁹⁵ This is a bizarre misunderstanding.

The concept under consideration is intricately intertwined with the notion of impartation, suggesting a causative relationship between the imparter and the activation of spiritual gifts. Additionally, it intimates that these gifts are imparted through instruction, implying that “special revelations” guide believers in performing actions that are only attributed to the agency of the Holy Spirit—an assertion deemed implausible. Furthermore, the authors proceed to swiftly segue into the discussion of the contentious Manifest Sons of God doctrine, seemingly insinuating that those they consider to be NAR

⁹³ Clark, *There is More!*, 26.

⁹⁴ Geivett and Pivec, *God’s Super-Apostles*, 96. Clark’s beliefs on impartation and the biblical basis for this practice is well documented in his book, *There is More!* I encourage the reader to read this book in full.

⁹⁵ Geivett and Pivec, *God’s Super-Apostles*, 101.

endorse this belief. Such assertions and accusations indiscriminately associate Clark with these teachings, which is factually inaccurate and reproachful.

First, it is imperative to underscore that Clark's lectures, instructional materials, and literary works do not contain any indications or implications supporting the notion that Christians will ultimately attain a state devoid of illness, mortality, or precipitate the unleashing of divine judgments upon the Earth.⁹⁶ Clark is a victorious amillennialist whose eschatology does not accommodate a belief structure that relates to the Manifest Sons of God Doctrine. Instead, he writes that the end-times church "will not be able to fully establish the kingdom of God because that requires the Second Coming of Jesus."⁹⁷

Second, Clark's teaching and practice of impartation have never implied that he carries "special revelation" to enable a believer to *learn* how to operate in the miraculous, or otherwise. The idea of "special revelation" is rejected in a joint statement that Clark and others wrote and signed on October 5, 2022. "WE REJECT the belief that 'new revelation' is essential for the life and growth of the church or that contemporary apostles or prophets are the only ones privy to such 'new revelation.'"⁹⁸ Additionally, in *There is More*, Clark repeatedly teaches that impartation is an anointing of the Holy Spirit with or without the laying on of hands.

To elaborate the point with greater scrutiny I shall incorporate insights from Clark's lecture to doctoral students at GATS. He states, "We do not teach that people are

⁹⁶ Geivett and Pivec, *God's Super-Apostles*, 104.

⁹⁷ Randy Clark, "Section 1: Addressing Issues Raised by New Apostolic Reformation," in Randy Clark, et al., *A Response to New Apostolic Reformation Critics*, rev. & expanded, 3rd ed, 17, online, <https://familyoffaith.academia.edu/RandyClark>.

⁹⁸ NAR & Christian Nationalism Statement, page 2. The full statement can be found online at Dr. Clark's Academia page, found here: https://www.academia.edu/89617161/NAR_Statement.

suddenly going to get some kind of anointing. It is not magic. I cannot give anyone anything. But with the teaching of the Word, [and] the testimony, there is a hunger for more of God, and he is the one who gives gifts and empowers—it is sovereign.”⁹⁹ If Clark is guilty of anything, it is focusing the saints on the Holy Spirit, how to hear and obey him so that God’s kingdom is manifest and people experience Christ. Through teaching the Word, Clark helps believers increase their expectation of God, to understand his ways and how he speaks, and then equips them to understand the gifts of the Spirit to be “co-workers in God’s service” (1 Cor. 3:9) for their operation.

The equipping of the saints is Christocentric, built upon knowing God, hearing him to obey, and is utterly dependent upon the Holy Spirit. Clark consistently emphasizes the work of Jesus on the Cross to bring the Father’s promise of the Holy Spirit (Luke 24:49).¹⁰⁰ This makes every believer “the New Covenant temple, built to host God’s presence in the power of His Spirit if we will but ‘make room’ for him around us and in us.”¹⁰¹ However, the key to successful discipleship is contingent upon knowing how God speaks to us so that we can act in obedience. Jesus said, “My sheep listen to my voice; I know them, and they follow me” (John 10:27).

While explaining the concept of equipping the saints to me, Clark beautifully emphasized this New Testament reality. Moses asked the Lord, “Teach me your ways” (Exod. 33:13). God has revealed himself and his preferences through the Scriptures. One prominent preference is that when God speaks, we hear and show our faith and obedience

⁹⁹ Clark, “Renewal Theology 4,” November 14, 2023, 10:12 am.

¹⁰⁰ Clark, *Destined for the Cross*, 67.

¹⁰¹ Clark, *Baptized in the Spirit*, 122.

by listening and doing. Just as the ways God spoke to the prophets differed, so too does God's voice differ today.¹⁰² God may use dreams, a vision, Scripture, an impression, an audible voice, provision, other believers, or a circumstance to express his will and voice.¹⁰³ The key is to learn how to recognize that it is God speaking. Many believers are hearing God; they just do not know how to recognize him.¹⁰⁴ This is one of the focuses of Clark's ministry: to help believers recognize God's voice. "So, faith comes from hearing, and hearing by the word of Christ" (Rom. 10:17, NASB).

Clark emphasizes the need to hear God by saying, "I'm a servant. And Paul actually uses the word as we translate servant, but it's much closer [to say] slave of Jesus."¹⁰⁵ Moo agrees with Clark, noting that when Paul says, "a slave of Christ" (Rom. 1:1), he is using an "Old Testament phrase 'slave,' or 'servant,' of Yahweh'. The phrase connotes total devotion, suggesting that the servant is completely at the disposal of his or her Lord."¹⁰⁶ This is Clark's meaning and the focus of equipping the saints. The growth of the Body of Christ is continually at the heart of Clark's teaching and writing, reflected in his words during our interview. "I believe that believers in Christ should be growing in

¹⁰² For example, the prophets would receive visions, or dreams, but other times we are not told (1 Chron. 17:3; isa. 21:2; Jer. 31:26; Lam. 2:9; Hosea 12:10; Joel 2:28; Micah 3:6; Acts 2:17-18; Heb. 1:1-3). Moses was an exception, who spoke to God face to face (Exod. 33:11). The life of Abraham makes this way of God exceptionally clear. God spoke and Moses listened (Gen. 12; 13; 15).

¹⁰³ Clark, *Baptized in the Spirit*, 151.

¹⁰⁴ I have summarized significantly. Clark, interview, 18:32-19:24.

¹⁰⁵ Clark, interview, 22:15.

¹⁰⁶ Douglas J. Moo, *The Epistle to the Romans*, The New International Commentary on the New Testament (Grand Rapids, MI W.B. Eerdmans Pub. Co., 1996), <https://thedtl.on.worldcat.org/oclc/34933859>, 50.

their knowledge of the Word (on paper) and their knowledge, in the sense of the experience of Jesus, *the Word, the Logos*, that became flesh.”¹⁰⁷

In *What’s Wrong with Protestant Theology*, Ruthven’s discussion of New Testament discipleship joyfully defines this biblical emphasis. Discipleship is distinguished most prominently by hearing and obeying, which is the fullest definition of faith.¹⁰⁸ Clark adds to this, noting that the indwelling of God’s Presence has introduced the only New Testament “law” —that we hear God’s voice directly.¹⁰⁹ This means that the Holy Spirit within us is not impersonal, quiet, or without power, as some traditional theological education promotes. Instead, as Jesus modeled perfect intimacy with the Father in activity and speech (John 5:19; 12:49), so too all believers hear the Spirit’s guidance to live in the Father’s will.

Think of it this way: humanity is made in the image of God and is set apart to have “personal affinity with God, and the possibility of receiving revelation and communicating in prayer.”¹¹⁰ In *Destined for the Cross*, Clark delightfully explains that one of the reasons Jesus died was so that we could be reconciled to our Father (Col. 1:21-23) and walk in obedience by his Spirit (John 14:7), who will reveal to us how to walk as

¹⁰⁷ Clark, interview, 20:37

¹⁰⁸ Jon Mark Ruthven, *What’s Wrong with Protestant Theology: Tradition Vs. Biblical Emphasis* (Lee’s Summit, MO: Christos Publishing, 2022), 289.

¹⁰⁹ Clark, *Baptized in the Spirit*, 139. I would encourage the reader to examine Ruthven’s chapter 14, “Discipleship Goals and Method Based on New Testament Emphases” in *What’s Wrong with Protestant Theology?* Ruthven, establishes how the New Testament on “hearing” has shifted to an intellectual experience only, substituting the voice of God to doctrines as opposed to a full and realized relationship with Jesus.

¹¹⁰ Lanier Burns, *The Nearness of God: His Presence with His People*, Explorations in Biblical Theology (Phillipsburg, NJ: P & R Publishing, 2009), 41.

Jesus walked, including doing the works that he did (John 14:12).¹¹¹ Clark explains that the context specifies the “works” of Jesus “refer to the signs and wonders, healing and miracles.”¹¹² But these works can only happen if we understand the Father’s will because “it is with God’s energy, not our own power, that we labor” (Col. 1:29).¹¹³

For this reason, Clark’s renewal theology has a significant emphasis on walking in obedience to the Lord by hearing and obeying the voice of our Father (John 10:27; Rom. 10:17; Heb. 3:15). Clark highlights this reality based on the example patterned by Abraham’s faith. Abraham hears the LORD and obeys “even when it is risky, dangerous, and difficult to do so (Gen. 12:1, 4; 15:4-6, 9-10, 23; 21:9-14; 22:2-3).”¹¹⁴

The Concept of Revelation

Unfortunately, hearing the voice of God is a source of great controversy. Critics claim that some apostles “claim to speak directly for God,” or “...apostles and prophets have the ‘new revelations’ their followers need to develop miraculous powers, bring God’s kingdom, and fulfill his will on earth.”¹¹⁵ Clark has never claimed to speak directly for God. He has never claimed to have something unique that no one else has. Nor has he claimed that his words are on par with that of the Canon.

¹¹¹ Clark, *Destined for the Cross*, 135-43.

¹¹² Clark, *Destined for the Cross*, 143.

¹¹³ Clark, *Destined for the Cross*, 145.

¹¹⁴ Randy Clark, “A Study of the Effects of Christian Prayer on Pain or Mobility Restrictions from Surgeries Involving Implanted Materials” (DMin diss., United Theological Seminary, Dayton OH, December 2013), 53.

¹¹⁵ Pivec and Geivett, *Counterfeit Kingdom*, 69-71.

On the contrary, during our interview, Clark called himself fallible. In follow up, I asked, “But if you say that ‘I’m fallible,’ it sounds to me like you’re saying your words are not on par with Scripture or become Scripture.”¹¹⁶ He replied, “No, I think it’s ludicrous that anybody would teach that. To be honest with you, I think it is unfair that anyone would charge us of saying that, especially when there’s so many ways and places that it’s been very clear.”¹¹⁷ Indeed, Clark states explicitly and consistently that the Canon is closed and is the standard for interpreting inspirations of the Holy Spirit.¹¹⁸

Clark recognizes that a significant part of the problem relates to using the word revelation and seeks to resolve the tension to enhance unity. It may be better to use the word inspiration, insight, or guidance to express what one believes the Holy Spirit has said.¹¹⁹ Keener also notes that the word revelation is often a source of discomfort among charismatics, while the word inspiration may be used to express that “God’s Spirit can lead our daily lives.”¹²⁰ This is Clark’s intended purpose when he speaks of the revelation of the Holy Spirit to guide believers to know the Father’s will: this is specific revelation.

Clark and others, differentiate between the types of revelation. Romans 1:20 speaks of God’s general revelation available to all. 2 Timothy 3:15-16 and 2 Peter 1:20-21 express God’s *special revelation*, in that Scripture is God’s creative breath, divinely

¹¹⁶ Clark, interview, 13:51.

¹¹⁷ Clark, interview, 14:07.

¹¹⁸ Randy Clark, “Renewal Theologies 2,” doctoral lecture for the DMin and ThD, semester 1, in Mechanicsburg, PA, November 13, 2023. This aspect of revelation will be dealt with more comprehensively in a larger future work. At present, the concept of revelation includes only hearing the voice of God in equipping the saints for the work of ministry. I have not elaborated on the issue of prophecy in this paper as space does not allow.

¹¹⁹ Clark, interview, 03:17.

¹²⁰ Keener, *Gift and Giver*, 148.

inspired and *perfect revelation*. *Specific revelation* is neither of the other types of revelation. Is the expected guidance of a loving Father given by the Holy Spirit. All believers should expect God to provide guidance, especially when we know Scripture does not address all aspects of life. Such as when to move to a new location, start a church in a particular area, or start a church for a particular group of people. Clark says of this truth, “Paul prays that God would give us a Spirit of wisdom and revelation so that we can, you know, understand and grow, and all. So, when I use the word revelation, it’s specific revelation. Like, how did I know I was to go to St. Louis and start a church? There was *specific revelation*, and it wasn’t canonical.”¹²¹

Ephesians 1:17 speaks of the discernable and applicable revelation of the Holy Spirit to have increased “personal knowledge of God” (cf. Col. 1:10).¹²² The increase in knowledge comes only by the Spirit of God giving understanding. More specifically, Turner notes that God’s Spirit brings insights that are intended to raise awareness of God’s will, not to provide “neutral facts, data, or propositions”—God’s insights are transformative and life-giving.¹²³ Specific revelation explains the Father’s will for a given purpose, need, or direction. An excellent example of specific revelation is the gift of a word of knowledge (1 Cor. 12:8). When the Holy Spirit gives a word of knowledge for healing; it is a timely inspiration of the Spirit to say what it is that God wants to heal, and it increases faith that he will do it. However, because we all know and prophesy in part (1

¹²¹ Clark, interview, 03:17. Emphasis mine.

¹²² Bruce, *Ephesians*, 269.

¹²³ Max Turner, *The Holy Spirit and Spiritual Gifts: In the New Testament Church and Today*, revised ed. (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academics, 2012), 112, <https://thetdl.on.worldcat.org/oclc/894429877>.

Cor. 13:9), words of knowledge are given with humility and expectation. As Clark teaches, “Give your words of knowledge humbly. Model humility. Never talk as if you are sure when you are not.”¹²⁴

Additionally, Clark has frequently taught about Paul’s specific revelation in his missionary journey into Macedonia. In Acts 16, the Spirit of God keeps Paul and his companions from entering Asia. Scripture does not indicate how this direction came from the Holy Spirit, which is biblical proof that not all received revelation (or guidance or inspiration) is canonical. We do not know how they were “kept by the Holy Spirit from preaching the word in the province of Asia” (16:6), and the same happened when “they tried to enter Bithynia” (16:7). Moreover, Paul’s night vision, or dream (16:9; 18:9), is interpreted in both instances as direction. The first is a vision of a man; the second is of the Lord speaking. Keener’s commentary, *Acts*, also notes that Paul’s vision in 16:9 provides guidance after the dream is interpreted corporately (16:10).¹²⁵ God will lead and guide through dreams and visions, even to begin a missionary journey into Europe!¹²⁶

Specific inspiration from the Holy Spirit is necessary when the Bible cannot tell us what is needed. For example, when to leave a job, to awake at night for intercession, or how best to minister the gospel to someone in need. All disciples of Christ need the living Person of the Holy Spirit to give guidance, help, and comfort as the needs arise.

¹²⁴ Clark, “Words of Knowledge for Healing,” in Johnson and Clark, *The Essential Guide to Healing*, 202-204.

¹²⁵ Craig S. Keener, *Acts*, New Cambridge Bible Commentary (Cambridge, United Kingdom: Cambridge University Press, 2020), <https://thedtl.on.worldcat.org/oclc/1120784623>, “16:6-10: God’s Leading to Macedonia, para. 9; para. 10. Keener also highlights that dream interpretation is a divine gift (see Gen. 40:8; Dan. 1:17).

¹²⁶ Clark, “Renewal Theology 1,” November 13, 2024.

Jesus came not to do his will, but the Father's will (John 6:38). He is our pattern, who showed us how to do as the Father commands (John 14:31). As his disciples we show our love for him by obedience (John 14:15). This is summarized beautifully by Ruthven, "Jesus, against traditional religion of all ages, faithfully follows the emphasis of the Bible, which is to promote the central mandate of mankind: to hear and heed God's voice and to imitate Jesus, who modeled this perfectly" (John 5:37-30, 46).¹²⁷

To emphasize the argument, I asked Clark to respond to one of the statements made by Geivett and Pivec. They assert that modern-day apostles and prophets give "new 'revelations' to the global church, critical truths the church once had and later lost. These lost truths are now being restored by Johnson, Vallotton, and other 'apostles' and 'prophets' so that all Christians can develop miraculous powers."¹²⁸ In response Clark relates aspects of revelation to how the Holy Spirit can teach believers the meaning of Scripture in a new or deeper way throughout their life. As a pastor, Clark has experienced receiving insight into biblical texts noting there have been times one may "get an understanding that you may not have seen before."¹²⁹ These kinds of insights with Scripture are common and in many ways is the foundation to the Protestant Reformation.

For example, González notes that Luther's interpretation of the sacrament of communion rejected the doctrine of transubstantiation to assert his newer understanding that was later termed consubstantiation. The change for Luther was due to his insight (or

¹²⁷ Jon Mark Ruthven, *What's Wrong with Protestant Theology: Tradition Vs. Biblical Emphasis* (Lee's Summit, MO: Christos Publishing, 2022), 2.

¹²⁸ Pivec and Geivett, *Counterfeit Kingdom*, 27-29.

¹²⁹ Clark, interview, 15:04.

revelation) of Jesus's words, "this is my body."¹³⁰ This is an example of a scriptural revelation that changed doctrine. The revelation was in the text. These forms of revelation are not *ex-cathedra* but are a form of biblical revelation. In this instance, the changes to doctrine were profound, and most Protestants accept this shift away from the Roman Catholic view of communion. Therefore, on a fundamental level the concept of a Holy Spirit inspired interpretation of the Bible is unequivocally accepted and adopted, even if it is unknown by most. Throughout his tenure in service to the Lord, Clark has not conveyed any transformative insights akin to those of prominent figures such as Luther.

Clark astutely observes that critics highlight the condemnation of apostles and prophets for possessing insights and wisdom, contrasting this with the acceptance of pastors receiving insight for preaching. "When it says, 'but apostles and prophets...' that really frustrates me. Pastors do this, but [to say] 'apostles and prophets' in a way indicates that they are not really teaching the Word."¹³¹ The critics in this instance are utilizing the strawman argument, which is a logical fallacy, which I surmise is solely based on the acceptance of the term apostle and prophet. As previously examined, and as will be further explored below, Clark's commitment to delivering accurate teachings of the Word of God are distinguished.

Continuing our interview on this topic Clark says,

God still speaks. Jesus, in the Upper Room Discourse really talks about it. We love him, and obey him, and he is going to reveal himself to us.... So, what we do is teach from the Word of God. This whole thing about John 14 through 16 is

¹³⁰ Justo L. González, *The Story of Christianity: The Reformation to the Present Day*, vol. II, 2nd ed. (New York, NY: HarperCollins, 2010), 54-55.

¹³¹ Clark, interview, 15:04.

huge for me because if I love God, I need to obey God. And if I'm obeying God there is a promise that he will reveal himself....¹³²

Clark is describing the Paraclete, the Spirit of prophecy. In *The Holy Spirit and Spiritual Gifts*, Turner elaborates on the Upper Room Discourse. The Paraclete is the successor, substitute, and presence of Jesus post-ascension. Turner observes that Jesus and the Spirit have both been sent from “the Father to the world (John 3:16-17; 5:43; 16:27-28; 16:7-8, 13; 18:37//14:26; 15:26; 16:7, 8, 13). Both are called ‘Holy’ (6:69//14:26) and are characterized by ‘the Truth’ (14:6//14:17; 15:26; 16:13). If Jesus is the great teacher (cf. 13:13-14), the Paraclete will ‘teach you...all things’ (14:26)....”¹³³ The promise of the Paraclete is to act just as Jesus had while Incarnate, to teach all things. “*The Spirit is to take over that role.* So John portrays the Spirit as replacing Jesus and taking over his ‘Paraclete’ functions.”¹³⁴

The theological significance of this passage lies in its clear connection to the existential reality of believers relying on what the Paraclete has been sent to provide. The consequence of the reception of the Spirit of God, the Spirit of prophecy, is to recognize his role to offer “both charismatic revelation and the wisdom to be able to integrate this into theology and praxis.”¹³⁵ Revelation, or insight and guidance, from the Spirit of God was never to have ceased and have been long anticipated.

The Spirit of prophecy has remained the focus of the Spirit of God in both the Old Testament and other Jewish sources. According to Keener, the Holy Spirit as the Spirit,

¹³² Clark, interview, 16:34-17:36.

¹³³ Turner, *The Holy Spirit and Spiritual Gifts*, 80.

¹³⁴ Turner, *The Holy Spirit and Spiritual Gifts*, 80. Italics original.

¹³⁵ Turner, *The Holy Spirit and Spiritual Gifts*, 88.

or agency, of prophecy, is mentioned more commonly both in rabbinical and non-rabbinical texts, with the former having a much more universal aspect.¹³⁶ For Keener, the “rabbis were not alone in associating the Spirit with prophecy,” who affords a revelatory ability to humans.¹³⁷ For example, Keener notes that *Jubilees* mentions “a spirit of prophecy came out of his mouth,” which is similar to the Holy Spirit inspiring Ezra to write or others to sing songs.¹³⁸ Many rabbis believed the Spirit of prophecy had ended, yet there remained a remnant with an eschatological hope that the Spirit would be restored.¹³⁹ Thus, the early church had a pneumatological foundation upon which to base their use of prophecy. There has never been a time when God’s people did not anticipate the democratization of his Spirit who would enable direct communication with him. This is why Clark’s focus on the Upper Room Discourse for life is vital for comprehension.

Demonstrating the Kingdom of God

According to Clark, the gifts of the Spirit help to “destroy the works of the devil” (1 John 3:8; cf. Matt. 12:29), as Jesus demonstrated, which is a key aspect of preaching the gospel. He writes, “I believe these gifts [sign gifts] are part of the gospel and are meant to show that the kingdom of God is at hand. Given to reveal God’s mercy and love for his people, they are meant to benefit us more than evidence of correct doctrine. I

¹³⁶ Keener, *The Spirit in the Gospels and Acts*, 9-11.

¹³⁷ Keener, *The Spirit in the Gospels and Acts*, 11.

¹³⁸ Keener, *The Spirit in the Gospels and Acts*, 11; 31, fn56; 32, fn60. Keener references 4 Ezra 14:22 and Ps -Philo 42:14, respectively.

¹³⁹ Keener, *The Spirit in the Gospels and Acts*, 16.

believe they are demonstrations of God's grace and divine enablements."¹⁴⁰ In *Demonstrating the Kingdom*, Morpew explains, "The kingdom comes through the power of the Holy Spirit." Morpew describes three biblical points representing this theme in Luke-Acts. The birth of Christ by the Holy Spirit (Luke 1:32-34), which sparked the messianic age; the beginning of Jesus's ministry after the Holy Spirit's baptism (Luke 3:21-22); and Jesus declaring his ministry to be the fulfillment of Isaiah's prophecy (Luke 4:16-21). The Acts narrative then revolves around the disciples receiving the empowerment of the Holy Spirit (Luke 24:49; Acts 1:4-8) to further the same message and ministry of Jesus.¹⁴¹

The gifts of the Holy Spirit are divine enablements, which, according to 2 Peter 1:3-4, are "his divine power [which] has given us everything we need for a godly life," and participation "in the divine nature." But these promises and participation in God's nature, by his Spirit, may not be known by some or experienced by others. Just as the Corinthian church required training on what they did not lack (1 Cor. 1:4-7), so do the saints today. The Corinthians were fixated on their speech gifts, as are many Christians, in the form of teaching with a moral lifestyle. That is good, but it is not enough. The Holy Spirit is the Spirit of Christ given to set captives free, heal the sick, deliver the demonized, and preach the gospel with a demonstration of God's power (Luke 4:16-19; 9:2; 10:9).¹⁴² All of these were demonstrated by Jesus, who exercised his kingdom

¹⁴⁰ Randy Clark, "A Theology of Healing," Part 2, in Bill Johnson and Randy Clark, *The Essential Guide to Healing: Equipping all Christians to Pray for the Sick* (Bloomington, MN: Chosen Books, 2011), 57.

¹⁴¹ Morpew, *Demonstrating the Kingdom*, 22.

¹⁴² See especially Clark, *Destined for the Cross*, chapter 1.

message, which was at the heart of his ministry (Mark 1:14-15). Clark works to equip the saints to continue the message and ministry of Jesus with the presence of the Holy Spirit, bringing the kingdom of God.

Additional Signs of the Apostolic

There are New Testament indicators to recognize the apostolic function, but nowhere does the Scripture offer an actual definition.¹⁴³ Ruthven notes that apostolic authority remains unclear, and even the Apostle Paul had to defend his apostleship to “some of his own churches!”¹⁴⁴ Helpfully, Keener concludes four “regularly characterized” features of an apostle.¹⁴⁵ First, Keener notes that apostles are often like pioneers, planting churches or creating ministries where they do not exist, not “building on someone else’s foundation” (Rom. 15:20).¹⁴⁶ This is not to mean that apostles are only missionaries, though several are and have been.

The Lord sends those given to the church with an apostolic function with a specific purpose. The New Testament reveals that God will often use particular people as his chosen instrument for a period or for a people group. For example, Paul calls himself “the apostle to the Gentiles” (Rom. 11:13), notes that Peter had a different sphere among “the circumcised” (Gal. 2:7), and calls James, Peter, and John “pillars” of the church

¹⁴³ Keener, *Gift and Giver*, 130.

¹⁴⁴ Ruthven, *On the Cessation*, 217.

¹⁴⁵ Keener, *Gift and Giver*, 128-30. Keener’s discussion lists three characteristics with the third combining sacrificial living with signs. I have separated the final two listing four characteristics.

¹⁴⁶ Keener, *Gift and Giver*, 128.

(Gal. 2:9). Therefore, those who have an apostolic function also have different spheres or cultures of influence.

While Wimber felt called to minister specifically to evangelicals, Clark's apostolic sphere of influence has been the entire Body of Christ, especially leaders and pastors in the ministry.¹⁴⁷ Twice, when meeting Clark, Wimber heard the audible voice of God tell him that Clark would be sent to the nations to "lay hands on people to be filled and activated in the gifts of the spirit."¹⁴⁸ However, Wimber only said to Clark, "There's an apostolic call on your life."¹⁴⁹ Clark says this was at a time in his life when he neither knew of nor fully believed in the apostolic ministry.¹⁵⁰ Yet, Clark's answer was, "Yes!"

Many are familiar with the 1994 Toronto outpouring, in which the Lord used Clark to spark countless missionaries and churches. Jesus sent Clark on this apostolic mission, through which many pastors, leaders, apostles, missionaries, teachers, evangelists, and other leaders have been raised and empowered for their call. Dr. Connie Dawson, who wrote John Wimber's biography, *John Wimber: His Life and Ministry*, speaks of the after-effects of "The Toronto Blessing," or "The Father's Blessing." Dawson writes,

Out of Toronto came Roland and Heidi Baker's work in Mozambique, which now has over ten thousand churches and has seen over 1 million conversions. Leif Hetland was also impacted by Toronto, and his ministry in Pakistan has now seen

¹⁴⁷ Connie Dawson, *John Wimber: His Life and Ministry* (Independently published, 2020), 201; Personal experiences of hearing Dr. Clark speak of his ministry at various conferences and in classrooms.

¹⁴⁸ Clark, "Ecclesiology: Third Wave Distinctives," 6:00.

¹⁴⁹ Randy Clark, *Lighting Fires*, reprint (United States of America: Apostolic Network of Global Awakening, 1998); Clark, *There Is More!*, 32. Blaine Cook later told Clark that Wimber had not only a prophetic word for him but that twice he had heard God's audible voice speak to him about Clark's calling. Clark, "Ecclesiology: Third Wave Distinctives."

¹⁵⁰ Clark, interview, 42:02.

over a million conversions. A work in Brazil was only three years old with three thousand churches.... Today this pastor has thirty thousand members in his local church and oversees over half a million people.... Clark's ministry has influenced many other denominations and churches as well...traditional, non-Pentecostal denominations such as Roman Catholic, Baptist, and Reformed. He was asked to help transition a denomination in Europe from its cessationist position to the continuationist position. He has worked with the largest Baptist churches in Argentina, Brazil, and South Africa, through which several hundreds of thousands of people have been saved and discipled after having been touched by the power of God's Spirit. Henry Madava, an apostolic leader in the Ukraine, has seen over a million conversions in his ministry ever since his church was touched through Clark's ministry.¹⁵¹

Clark also mentions the "Moscow Blessing" in 1996, and the Lord's presence in Norway, England, and Northern Ireland where "many were healed...and countless others testified that they were empowered with a fresh anointing of the Holy Spirit."¹⁵² During our interview, Clark stated that though it was never his desire to travel outside of the United States, since the Lord called him, he has traveled to "Fifty-five different countries, hundreds, altogether, hundreds and hundreds of times. Brazil now over 120 times. And there are signs and wonders that happened in my life. That is the work of God, as Paul said in Romans 15... that he wouldn't boast on anything he has done."¹⁵³

In *There is More!*, Clark states the same about being a fire starter for the Lord in multiple countries. "I just want to say that ushering in this revival was not something Randy Clark did; God did it all. In his desire to take failure and turn it into his strength,

¹⁵¹ Dawson, *John Wimber*, 202. The Toronto revival continued for six nights per week for more than a dozen years and was a part of a larger worldwide move of the Spirit of God. The Arnott's share that since the first days of the outpouring over 2,000,000 have visited "Catch the Fire Toronto," and that their ministry continues to expand. John Arnott, "The Toronto Blessing: What Is It?" *John & Carol*, December 31, 1999, online, <https://www.johnandcarol.org/updates/the-toronto-blessing-what-is-it>.

¹⁵² Clark, *Lighting Fires*, 121.

¹⁵³ Clark, interview, 42:02.

God orchestrated events that touched my life and drew me into new places.”¹⁵⁴ Clark’s ministry, Global Awakening, has also developed the accredited programs of a master’s and doctoral degree at Global Awakening Theological Seminary of Family of Faith Christian University.¹⁵⁵ The Lord has used Clark to build as a master builder, raise up other leaders and fivefold ministers, baptize countless thousands in the Holy Spirit, and spark numerous revivals around the world. Clark’s ministry is similar to that of John Wesley who considered the world as his parish.¹⁵⁶

Keener’s second feature is that apostolic ministry carries an authority based on servanthood (2 Cor. 4:5; cf. Phil. 2:5-8), which is different from institutionally recognized authority.¹⁵⁷ As Clark stated, he can appeal, like Paul (1 Cor. 1:10), and reason with the churches when needed (2 Cor. 1:24; 8:8), but he also had more authority to lead in the churches he has planted, such as Paul in 2 Corinthians 2:9. However, the motivation is serving out of love, not control, because those within the planted churches are living epistles. As Keener states, “This is the language of a loving relationship, not pure institutional authority. Apostolic authority seemed to flow from apostles’ special

¹⁵⁴ Clark, *There Is More!*, 38.

¹⁵⁵ This is a relatively short list and I encourage the reader to visit Globalawakening.com to learn more about the ministries and opportunities associated with Global Awakening.

¹⁵⁶ John Wesley, *The Journal of John Wesley Founder of the Methodist Movement* (First published by F. H. Revell in 1903; 2016 ed, no publication city), 65. In numerous instances, whether through personal conversation in a master’s or doctoral level course, or in a lecture setting, Clark has told me and other students that he, like Wesley, considers the world his parish. A ministry and calling Clark has remained faithful to over the decades.

¹⁵⁷ Keener, *Gift and Giver*, 128-29.

message, a message often more authoritative than that of prophets (Acts 2:42; 4:33; though compare Luke 11:49; Eph. 3:5).”¹⁵⁸

If Jesus commissions someone to be apostolic, that ministry should be marked by love and servant leadership. There are consistent testimonies of many whom Clark touches in this way. For example, current ThD and DMin students said, “I do believe Dr. Clark’s leadership is servanthood as I have seen him model it in the ways he prays for people and the time he gives his students.” “I feel a sense of honor toward him, a tremendous sense of gratitude for how his selfless pouring out of his life to serve and model has impacted not just mine, but countless others, and maybe more like an indebtedness.” “Dr. Clark models the life of a true servant of the Lord, a faithful theologian who handles the Word of God correctly, and who lives to humbly bless others with *gracelets* or *charisms* of the Holy Spirit.”¹⁵⁹

Clark’s ministry creates a community like that of Paul and the Philippians. Paul says, “I thank my God every time I remember you.... I always pray with joy because of your partnership in the gospel from the first day until now.... It is right for me to feel this way about you since I have you in my heart” (Phil. 1:3, 4, 7). A Spirit-filled heart connection develops in the partnership of the gospel. As a father in the faith (cf. 1 Cor. 4:15), Clark carries the spiritual authority any spiritual father would have, as well as the love, honor, and respect he has earned because of his love and service to equip the Body in service to Jesus and the furtherance of the gospel.

¹⁵⁸ Keener, *Gift and Giver*, 129.

¹⁵⁹ These are from the fall of 2024 acceptance to the program Global Awakening Theological Seminary of Family of Faith University doctoral degree programs. Testimonies in order of appearance are from: Carol Knopp, Barbara Colacchia, and Lutheran pastor Jon Beyer. Through personal email communications with the author, December 12-13, 2024. Please see the Appendix for more.

Clark also has the heart of an apostle in that he is like Paul who says, “I long to see you so that I may impart to you some spiritual gift to make you strong” (Rom. 1:11). But this desire is understood in light of Colossians 1:27-29, knowing that he can give nothing, but it is “Christ in you the hope of glory,” powerfully working his energies that imparts and stirs as he chooses and desires. As Paul believed, Clark and other apostolic leaders “believe that God can use them to see pastors and leaders be filled and be used by God. We believe God will stir up the gifts and callings in others; it is him who does it.”¹⁶⁰

Sacrificial ministry is the third of Keener’s apostolic features.¹⁶¹ When the Apostle Paul lists his apostolic sufferings (1 Cor. 4:9-13; 2 Cor. 11:12-13), he relates them to proof of his apostolic calling. One of the issues Paul lists is translated as “cursed” by the NIV, but the NASB, NKJV, and ESV translate “cursed” as “reviled” (1 Cor. 4:12). Fee, in his commentary, *The First Epistle to the Corinthians*, suggests that the verb λοιδορέω, “when we are reviled,” is presented in the noun form and therefore “slandered” is a better fitting translation, especially since part of Paul’s defense to the Corinthians is because he and other apostles are being slandered.¹⁶² Admittedly, I have avoided using the term “slander” to describe how the critics are twisting so much of Clark’s ministry and teaching. Paul’s response in 1 Corinthians 4:12, εὐλογοῦμεν is translated by the NIV as “we bless,” which Fee recognizes as Paul’s typical response in other passages (c. 1:10;

¹⁶⁰ Clark, “Renewal Theology 4,” November 14, 2024, 10:10am.

¹⁶¹ Keener, *Gift and Giver*, 129.

¹⁶² Gordon D. Fee, *The First Epistle to the Corinthians*, Rev. ed., The New International Commentary on the New Testament (Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2014), <https://thetdtl.on.worldcat.org/oclc/881385741>, 171.

4:16) and should read, “we answer kindly, or “we humbly make our appeal.”¹⁶³ This paper partly appeals to enhance Christian unity according to Ephesians 1:1-6, for we are all members of one body because we have been given his Spirit. Unity in Christ is part of God’s signature design and an explicit revelation that we belong to him as one body though many parts (1 Cor. 12:12-27).

Other aspects of sacrificial living that pertain to a call God has placed on someone’s life are documented by Roberts Liardon. Liardon’s books, *God’s Generals*, and correlating YouTube video series recount time and again that the significant cost of those before us, such as John G. Lake, Jack Coe, and Kathryn Kuhlman (a short list), was paid for in their physical bodies. Of Aimee Semple McPherson, Liardon recounts that before her untimely death, McPherson “was suffering from tropical infections that she had contracted during her missionary trips.”¹⁶⁴

Clark has experienced traveler’s back with three herniated spinal discs with two pinched nerves from travelling over 3,000,000 miles since the Toronto outpouring, which began in January 1994. He was unable to walk without crutches and was in physical therapy for ninety days before God miraculously healed his spine. Additionally, while ministering in Nigeria, Clark was accidentally injured by a conference attendee, which resulted in four herniated discs. Yet, God is faithful and healed these discs allowing Clark to continue travelling, even over 1,000,000 miles since the diagnosis of traveler’s back. The physical cost is part of the sacrifice.

¹⁶³ Fee, *Corinthians*, 171.

¹⁶⁴ Roberts Liardon, *God’s Generals: Why They Succeeded and Why Some Fail*, Reprint ed. (New Kensington, PA: Whitaker House, 2000), 264.

Kuhlman stated, “Paying the price is never a one-time experience,” and “It’ll cost you everything, absolutely everything.”¹⁶⁵ For Kuhlman, the cost related to an early death and never having a family. The sacrificial ministry of any call of God on one’s life often impacts the minister’s family. For example, though the Lord gave DeAnne Clark Isaiah 49:1-10 as a word of understanding and comfort, the cost to the Clark household of having a husband and a father on the road for more than half a year at a time, consistently, has been high.¹⁶⁶

Finally, Keener’s last characteristic of the apostolic is *signs*, which Paul includes on his list to prove his calling (2 Cor. 12:11-12).¹⁶⁷ Paul explains to the Corinthians that the “signs” of an apostle were a matter of consistency (not a one-time deal) and that they were σημείοις τε καὶ τέρασιν καὶ δυνάμεσιν, “...signs and marvels and through powerful deeds.”¹⁶⁸ Harris concludes that these three nouns do not express three distinct kinds of miracles but that Paul’s signs of an apostle can “...authenticate (‘signs’), to arouse awe (‘marvels’), and to display divine power (‘powerful deeds’).”¹⁶⁹ In the Old Testament, the

¹⁶⁵ Roberts Liardon, *Kathryn Kuhlman: A Spiritual Biography of God’s Miracle Worker* (New Kensington, PA: Whitaker House, 2005), 35; 41.

¹⁶⁶ Clark, *Lighting Fires*, 95. This section of Clark’s book only relates to when the international ministry was beginning and does not express the nature of the cost from that time until the present. In a future dissertation, I will spend more time discussing this aspect of Clark’s apostolic ministry. Another significant cost to Clark is related to the healing ministry Jesus has given him. Though the victory of Christ and the power of the Holy Spirit are celebrated with every healing, there is pain and hardship embracing the mystery of the kingdom now-not yet aspect of our reality. Some who seek healing do not receive what they need and this can bring some healing evangelists to the end of their ministry. For more please see Randy Clark, *Power to Heal: Keys to Activating God’s Healing Power in Your Life* (Shippensburg, PA: Destiny Image Publishers, 2015), chapter 13.

¹⁶⁷ Keener, *Gift and Giver*, 129.

¹⁶⁸ Harris, *The Second Epistle to the Corinthians*, 873.

¹⁶⁹ Harris, *The Second Epistle to the Corinthians*, 875.

use of signs and wonders was always connected to the power of God for his purposes (Isa. 8:18; 20:3) and is often documented by Luke for the same purpose, to display the power of Christ's gospel (Acts 13:6-12; 14:8-10; 16:17-18; 19:11-12; 28:3-6, 8), which resulted in the development of churches who practiced miracles (Gal. 3:5; 1 Thess. 1:5; 1 Cor. 2:4; 2: Cor. 12:12).¹⁷⁰ Jesus is glorified, and the church is advanced by signs.

One of Paul's primary implications in 1 Corinthians 12:12 is that the false apostles were unable to perform these signs, which would bring glory to God and thereby authenticate Christ's gospel message. Moreover, biblical references to "false prophets," or others, who could perform signs (Mark 13:22; 2 Thess. 2:9; Rev. 13:13) are detectable because of their fruits (Matt. 7:16, 20). Grudem's discussion of Mark 13:22 and Matthew 7:16 explains that the cessationist fear that signs and wonders will deceive and trick the elect is unfounded. He writes,

The New Testament does not say false Christs and false prophets are so deceptive that even Christians cannot identify them. And it does *not* say false Christs *will* lead astray the elect; it just says that is the *purpose* they will try to accomplish. The Greek phrase is πρὸς τὸ ἀποπλανᾶν εἰ δυνατόν τοὺς ἐκλεκτούς, (literally) "for the purpose of leading astray, if possible, the elect" (Mark 13:22). But Satan's purpose in this will not be accomplished. Jesus promises us "*You will know them* by their fruits" (Matt. 7:16), and he says, "My sheep hear my voice, and I know them, and they follow me" (John 10:27).¹⁷¹

¹⁷⁰ Judith A. Diehl and Scot McKnight, *2 Corinthians*, The Story of God Bible Commentary Series (Grand Rapids, MI: HarperCollins Christian Publishing, 2020), <https://thedtl.on.worldcat.org/oclc/1259323076>, 371; Harris, *The Second Epistle to the Corinthians*, 875. All of the charismata, including those that have accompanying miracles express the gospel of Jesus. This is a primary focus of Ruthven's book *On the Cessation*. "[T]he charismata are divinely ordained manifestations of the risen and exalted Jesus; indeed, they are the 'power of god unto salvation.'" Ruthven, *On the Cessation*, 11.

¹⁷¹ Wayne Grudem, "Should Christians Expect Miracles Today? Objections and Answers from the Bible," in J.I. Packer, et al., *The Kingdom and the Power: Are Healing and the Spiritual Gifts Used by Jesus and the Early Church Meant for the Church Today?* eds. Gary S. Greig and Kevin N. Springer (Ventura CA: Regal Books, 1993), 57.

Therefore, a validating sign of apostleship is the ability to perform signs, wonders, and miracles that will bring glory to God and advance the church. However, the apostolic are not the only believers anointed for such a task. “Workers of miracles” and “gifts of healing” are also mentioned in 1 Corinthians 12:28. According to Greig, “The New Testament evidence clearly shows that God desires to heal the sick as a sign of his kingdom reign and his grace toward us in Christ (Matt. 12:28; cf. Isa. 33:22, 24) God desires to heal as a sign of his kingdom....”¹⁷²

For this reason, Clark has always worked to equip the saints in this kind of ministry. In *Eyewitness to Miracles*, after a section dedicated to God’s wonder-working testimonies, Clark invites the reader to understand that they, too, can be used by God in this way. He encourages the reader, saying, “May the realization of the continuation of the miraculous today cause you to hunger to know personally this supernatural God.”¹⁷³ Notice that Clark points the reader to know the God who performs the supernatural, not to seek to achieve the works themselves. His burden for the Body of Christ is that we would all walk in an authentic relationship with God, hearing his voice and acting in accordance with his will. Hearing increases faith and can result in the gift of faith, which is mountain-moving faith.¹⁷⁴

¹⁷² Gary S. Greig, “The Purpose of Signs and Wonders in the New Testament,” in J.I. Packer, et al., *The Kingdom and the Power: Are Healing and the Spiritual Gifts Used by Jesus and the Early Church Meant for the Church Today?* eds. Gary S. Greig and Kevin N. Springer (Ventura CA: Regal Books, 1993), 158.

¹⁷³ Randy Clark, *Eyewitness to Miracles: Watching the Gospel Come to Life* (Nashville, TN: Thomas Nelson, 2018), 117.

¹⁷⁴ Clark, “A Study of the Effects of Christian Prayer,” 51-53. On page 53 Clark shows the link between John 8:39-47, Romans 4:11-12, and Galatians 3:7 to discuss what it is to be Abraham’s children, who exemplify faith like his.

The signs of the miracle-working power of God accompany Clark's ministry, which is one of the reasons he gave me for understanding his call to the apostolic. I asked, "What makes you apostolic?" His hands were clasped, his eyes were thoughtful, and he smiled as he replied, "I have seen a lot of people get saved because they have seen people get healed. One night, I saw 30,000 people come to Jesus because there'd been 50,000 healings in the hundred thousand crowd."¹⁷⁵ *Eyewitness to Miracles* is filled with miraculous testimonies of the blind seeing, the lame walking, various sicknesses healed, deaf ears opening, and the dead being raised, most of which Clark was present for. Moreover, testimonies continue to climb, telling of encounters with the Holy Spirit through a Randy Clark impartation moment. These encounters result in increased ministry focus, fruitfulness, and fulfillment, and many begin a healing ministry.¹⁷⁶

An additional sign of an apostle includes faithfulness to the apostolic message, as found in 2 Corinthians 11:4. Commentators note that Paul expresses three elements of this message: Jesus, the Spirit, and the gospel, which must remain in harmony.¹⁷⁷ The presentation of "another Jesus" would align with the deception of Satan, as Paul explains in 2 Corinthians 11:3, whereby the presentation to Christ, the Husband of his bride would be hindered because "sincere and pure devotion to Christ" has been ruined (v. 3). The

¹⁷⁵ Clark, interview, 43:12.

¹⁷⁶ See Tom Jones, "Divine Encounters: Analysis of Encounters That Shape Lives" (DMin diss., United Theological Seminary, Dayton OH, December 2013). Dr. Jones' dissertation is a rich study of the effects of Clark's ministry on those interviewed as well as those who sovereignly are touched by God, or otherwise. Jones presents the fruit of these encounters with the Holy Spirit with a "before and after" study. As well, see Clark, *There Is More!*, especially chapter 6.

¹⁷⁷ Murray J. Harris, *The Second Epistle to the Corinthians: A Commentary on the Greek Text*, The New International Greek Testament Commentary (Grand Rapids, MI: W.B. Eerdmans Pub. Co., 2005), <https://thcdtl.on.worldcat.org/oclc/56672293>, 743-44.

preaching of “Jesus Christ crucified” (1 Cor. 1:23) for “our sins according to the Scriptures, that he was buried, that he was raised on the third day according to the Scriptures” (1 Cor. 15:3-4) so that “by faith we might receive the promise of the Spirit” (Gal. 3:14). The three elements, Jesus, the Spirit, and the gospel cannot be separated.

Harris’ commentary, *The Second Epistle to the Corinthians*, summarizes Paul’s emphasis in 11:4. Paul’s Jesus-Spirit-gospel *kerygma* always “centered on Jesus Christ crucified and risen, on the gift of the Spirit of God or Christ as the fulfillment of promise and the pledge of inheritance, and on the good news of forgiveness and reconciliation in Christ as the instrument of God’s saving power.”¹⁷⁸ According to Harris, Paul’s opponents, or false/super-apostles, would utilize similar nomenclature but with different content, changing the salvific message often by adding requirements, which was like the false prophets of the Old Testament who were moved by a spirit other than the Holy Spirit.¹⁷⁹

The apostolic message of 2 Corinthians 11:4 is preached by Clark consistently in his lectures, books, and sermons. One need only read through Clark’s *Destined for the Cross: 16 Reasons Jesus Had to Die* to ascertain the truth of his gospel message. Clark’s teaching has proven true as a disciple of Jesus through the years, and signs, wonders, and salvations characterize his ministry, and he has built as a master builder.

¹⁷⁸ Harris, *The Second Epistle to the Corinthians*, 743-44.

¹⁷⁹ Harris, *Second Epistle to the Corinthians*, 744; Keener, *Bible Background Commentary*, 510; Diehl & McKnight, *2 Corinthians*, 352.

SUMMARY

The beginning of this paper focused on renewal theology Third Wave distinctives, that led to an introduction of the fivefold ministry found in Ephesians 4:11. Third Wave renewal theology upholds the continuation of these *doma* gifts, to equip the saints for the work of ministry, until the *Parousia*. The apostolic gifting of Clark was discussed to explore his belief and praxis in this *doma* ministry. In part, this discussion responded to critics who have labeled Clark using a guilt by association approach and dismantled their misunderstandings and conflating opinions. Additionally, I set out to establish the biblical basis and truth behind aspects of Clark's apostolic nature.

The idea that Clark is a NAR apostle who demands submission was dismantled. Clark leads by establishing relationships, building ecumenicism in the Holy Spirit, and by serving—he is a beloved father in the faith and is not an abusive authoritarian. Clark expresses Christian leadership using the euphemism, “the towel,” and an upside-down pyramid. Clark teaches on John 13:3-5, to describe the servant leadership that Jesus modelled and expects. As such, servant leadership is a key value of Clark and his network, ANGA. Servant leadership is also an important Third Wave value, utilizing additional passages such as Mark 10:45 and Matthew 20:25-28.

I then presented the continuation view of the fivefold ministry, with a focus on the apostolic function, which did not end with the closing of the Canon of Scripture. Care was given to explain that the ministry and authority of the Twelve and Paul can never be repeated, while biblically discussing continuation of the apostolic gift. The *doma* gifts serve as important leadership functions to equip the Body of Christ, helping to enhance Christian maturity, unity, and the understanding and praxis of the gifts of the Holy Spirit.

Clark's apostolic function relates to the call of the Lord Jesus on his life, which Clark has remained faithful to. Jesus has used Clark to ignite numerous revivals and raise up many apostles, pastors, evangelists, prophets, missionaries, and teachers throughout his decades of ministry. Impartation is a key aspect of Clark's ministry focus as the Holy Spirit has used Clark to baptize countless thousands and stir their God-given gifts and callings.

The concept of revelation was discussed to dismantle the false claim by critics that "new revelations," or "special revelations" are espoused by Clark as a means to demand submission. Otherwise called specific revelation, God makes his will known to his saints, though no inspiration is ever considered canonical. However, Clark's ministry focuses on equipping believers how to recognize God's voice to better learn his ways in order to co-labour with the Lord and expand the kingdom. If the word revelation is offensive, it would be better to say that the Spirit of God gives insight, inspiration, or guidance. The central issue of the New Testament is gift of the Holy Spirit who enables all believers to know and hear the Father's voice. As such, the guidance of the Holy Spirit reveals the Father's will on a day-to-day basis and is always measured against the standard of the Scriptures.

The critics claim that Clark teaches that he can transfer the ability to perform supernatural works, or other abilities, was proven untrue. Clark equips believers to hear the will of God and to act in accordance. The gift of the Holy Spirit gives the revelation of God's law into the minds and hearts of those who believe, and empowers the gospel in word and power (Jer. 31:33; Isa. 54:13; 59:21; Joel 2:28-29; Acts 1:8; 2:39; Heb. 8:8-12; 10:16-17). Clark's equipping ministry focuses believers on hearing (John 10:27) and doing by the power of the Holy Spirit.

Finally, signs of the apostolic function were reviewed with attention given to Clark's loving, humble, servant and sacrificial life with a section speaking of the evidence of supernatural signs that accompany the apostolic. It is my desire that those who read this paper will understand the truth of Clark's ministry, refuse to listen to those who have grossly misrepresented him, and that unity will result. Whether the Lord gives spiritual gifts by the Holy Spirit (cf. 1 Cor. 12:8-10; 1 Pet. 4:10-11; Rom. 12:6-8) or the ascended Lord gives gifted leaders to the Body of Christ, all are by divine appointment and instituted by the Holy Spirit. We need one another as we all serve "as Christ apportioned it" (Eph. 4:7). I encourage the reader to await the forthcoming dissertation, which will provide a comprehensive analysis of Clark's renewal theology and corresponding praxis.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Arnold, Clinton E. *Ephesians*. Kindle. Vol. Book 10. Zondervan Exegetical Commentary Series: New Testament. Grand Rapids, MI; Zondervan Academic, 2010.
- Burgess, Stanley M. *The New International Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements*, Stanley M. Burgess, Ed. 5th ed. Vol. 91. Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 2007. <https://thetdl.on.worldcat.org/oclc/951186418>.
- Clark, Randy, et al. *A Response to New Apostolic Reformation Critics*. Rev. & Expanded, 3rd ed. 2024. Online, <https://familyoffaith.academia.edu/RandyClark>.
- Clark, Randy. "A Study of the Effects of Christian Prayer on Pain or Mobility Restrictions from Surgeries Involving Implanted Materials." DMin diss. United Theological Seminary, Dayton OH, December 2013.
- . *Destined for the Cross: 16 Reasons Jesus Had to Die*. Nashville, TN: Thomas Nelson, 2020.
- . *Eyewitness to Miracles: Watching the Gospel Come to Life*. Nashville, TN: Thomas Nelson, 2018.
- . Interview by Genevieve Chartrand. Mechanicsburg, PA. November 16, 2024.
- . *Lighting Fires*. Reprint. United States of America: Apostolic Network of Global Awakening, 1998, repr. 2014.
- . "Renewal Theology 1-11." Doctoral lectures for the DMin and ThD, semester 1. Mechanicsburg, PA. November 13-16, 2023.
- . Session 4 — New Apostolic Reformation Issues. "Ecclesiology: Third Wave Distinctives (Jesus Gave the 5-Fold Offices to the Church: A Continuationist Perspective)." DRS8306: Theological Renewal Studies. From Family of Faith/Global Awakening Theological Seminary, August term, 2023, retrieved from <https://faithglobal.populiweb.com/router/courseofferings/10735283/lessons/10784040/show>.
- . Session 3 — Third Wave Distinctives, lesson video 1. "Christology (Jesus: Our Model for Discipleship, Kenotic and Non-Kenotic Perspectives, and Deliver from Captivity)." DRS8306: Theological Renewal Studies. From Family of Faith/Global Awakening Theological Seminary, August term 2023, retrieved from <https://faithglobal.populiweb.com/router/courseofferings/10735283/lessons/10784038/show>.
- . Session 3 — Third Wave Distinctives, lesson video 1. "Pneumatology 1, Part 2: The Baptism in the Holy Spirit (The Holy Spirit Activates Gifts within

Christians—both Situational and Constituted).” DRS8306: Theological Renewal Studies. From Family of Faith/Global Awakening Theological Seminary, August term 2023, retrieved from <https://faithglobal.populiweb.com/router/courseofferings/10735283/lessons/10784038/show>.

———. *The Essential Guide to the Power of the Holy Spirit: God’s Miraculous Gifts at Work Today*. Shippensburg, PA: Destiny Image, 2015.

———. *There Is More!: The Secret to Experiencing God’s Power to Change Your Life*. Minneapolis, MN: Chosen Books, 2013.

Clark, Randy, and Mary Healy. *The Spiritual Gifts Handbook: Using Your Gifts to Build the Kingdom*. Bloomington, MN: Chosen Books, 2018.

Dawson, Connie. *John Wimber: His Life and Ministry*. Independently published, 2020.

Diehl, Judith A., and Scot McKnight. *2 Corinthians*. The Story of God Bible Commentary Ser. Grand Rapids, MI: HarperCollins Christian Publishing, 2020. <https://thedtl.on.worldcat.org/oclc/1259323076>.

Douglas, J. D., F. F. Bruce, J. I. Packer, and N. Hillyer. *New Bible Dictionary*. Edited by D. Guthrie. 2nd ed. Downers Grove, IL: Intervarsity Press, 1994.

Eberle, Dr Harold R. *Father-Son Theology, Book 2: Biblical Theology Presented in a Systematic Way*. 3rd Edition. Yakima, WA: Worldcast Publishing, 2023.

Fee, Gordon D. *Paul, the Spirit, and the People of God*. Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 1996.

———. *The First Epistle to the Corinthians*. Rev. ed. The New International Commentary on the New Testament. Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2014. <https://thedtl.on.worldcat.org/oclc/881385741>.

Geivett, R. Douglas, and Holly Pivec. *God’s Super-Apostles: Encountering the Worldwide Prophets and Apostles Movement*. Bellingham, WA: Lexham Press, 2018.

Geivett, R. Douglas, and Holly Pivec. *A New Apostolic Reformation?: A Biblical Response to the Worldwide Movement*. Bellingham, WA: Lexham Press, 2014. <https://thedtl.on.worldcat.org/oclc/1055044424>.

González, Justo L. *The Story of Christianity: The Reformation to the Present Day*. Volume II. 2nd ed. New York, NY: HarperCollins, 2010.

Harris, Murray J. *The Second Epistle to the Corinthians: A Commentary on the Greek Text*. The New International Greek Testament Commentary. Grand Rapids, MI: W.B. Eerdmans Pub. Co., 2005. <https://thedtl.on.worldcat.org/oclc/56672293>.

- Hoehner, Harold W. *Ephesians: An Exegetical Commentary*. Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2002. <https://thedtl.on.worldcat.org/oclc/50124936>.
- Johnson, Bill, and Randy Clark. *The Essential Guide to Healing: Equipping All Christians to Pray for the Sick*. Bloomington, MN: Chosen Books, 2011.
- Jones, Tom. "Divine Encounters: Analysis of Encounters That Shape Lives." DMin diss. United Theological Seminary, Dayton OH, December 2013.
- Keener, Craig S. *Acts*. New Cambridge Bible Commentary. Cambridge, United Kingdom: Cambridge University Press, 2020. <https://thedtl.on.worldcat.org/oclc/1120784623>.
- . *Gift and Giver: The Holy Spirit for Today*. Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2001.
- . *The IVP Bible Background Commentary: New Testament*. Downers Grove, IL: Inter Varsity Press, 1993.
- . *The Spirit in the Gospels and Acts: Divine Purity and Power*. Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic. 1997.
- Liardon, Roberts. *God's Generals: Why They Succeeded and Why Some Fail*. Reprint ed. New Kensington, PA: Whitaker House, 2000.
- . *Kathryn Kuhlman: A Spiritual Biography of God's Miracle Worker*. New Kensington, PA: Whitaker House, 2005.
- Moo, Douglas J. *The Epistle to the Romans*. The New International Commentary on the New Testament. Grand Rapids, MI: W.B. Eerdmans Pub. Co., 1996. <https://thedtl.on.worldcat.org/oclc/34933859>.
- Moreland, J. P. *Kingdom Triangle*. Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 2007.
- Morphew, Derek. *Demonstrating the Kingdom: Tools for Christian Discipleship*. Vineyard International Publishing, 2019.
- Morris, Leon. *The Gospel According to John*. Rev. ed. The New International Commentary on the New Testament. Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 1995. <https://thedtl.on.worldcat.org/oclc/32465455>.
- Mounce, William D. *Mounce's Complete Expository Dictionary of Old and New Testament Words*. Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan Academic, 2006.
- NAR & Christian Nationalism Statement. October 5, 2022. Online, https://www.academia.edu/89617161/NAR_Statement.

- Olson, Roger E. *The Mosaic of Christian Belief: Twenty Centuries of Unity and Diversity*. 2nd edition. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Press, 2016.
- . *The Story of Christian Theology: Twenty Centuries of Tradition & Reform*. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Press, 1999.
- Packer, J.I., Jeffrey Niehaus, Wayne Grudem, Stanley M. Burgess, David Lewis, and John White. *The Kingdom and the Power: Are Healing and the Spiritual Gifts Used by Jesus and the Early Church Meant for the Church Today?* Edited by Gary S. Greig and Kevin N. Springer. Ventura, CA: Regal Books, 1737.
- Pivec, Holly, and R. Douglas Geivett. *Counterfeit Kingdom: The Dangers of New Revelation, New Prophets, and New Age Practices in the Church*. Brentwood, TN: B&H Publishing Group, 2022.
<https://thetdl.on.worldcat.org/oclc/1351200886>.
- Redeeming Truth Podcast. “EP 109 | The Truth About the NAR w/ Holly Pivec and Doug Geivett | Redeeming Truth.” May 17, 2023, YouTube video. Posted by Redeemer Bible Church AZ, <https://youtu.be/tXDq59eqtwg?si=fllktDFCouuxJtA1>.
- The Remnant Radio, “The NAR Debate! Randy Clark Responds to Dr. Doug Geivett and Holly Pivec.” YouTube, April 19, 2022.
<https://www.youtube.com/live/Bz8yCZXjH7I?si=vUqXgeXGZt2FVdxm>.
- Ruthven, Jon Mark. *On the Cessation of the Charismata: The Protestant Polemic on Post-Biblical Miracles*. Revised & Expanded Edition. United States of America: Word & Spirit Press, 2012.
- . *What’s Wrong with Protestant Theology: Tradition Vs. Biblical Emphasis*. Lee’s Summit, MO: Christos Publishing, 2022.
- Schnackenburg, Rudolf. *Ephesians: A Commentary*. Edinburg, T & T Clark, 1991.
<https://thetdl.on.worldcat.org/oclc/1244471296>.
- Synan, Vinson. *The Century of the Holy Spirit: 100 Years of Pentecostal and Charismatic Renewal, 1901-2001*. Nashville, TN: Thomas Nelson, 2001.
- St. Athanasius Academy of Orthodox Theology. *The Orthodox Study Bible*. Printed in China, 2008.
- Turner, Max. *The Holy Spirit and Spiritual Gifts: In the New Testament Church and Today*. Revised edition. Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academics a division of Baker Publishing Group, 2012. <https://thetdl.on.worldcat.org/oclc/894429877>.
- Wagner, Peter C. *The Third Wave of the Holy spirit: Encountering the Power of Signs and Wonders*. Ann Arbor, MI: Servant Publications, 1988.

Wesley, John. *The Journal of John Wesley Founder of the Methodist Movement*. Edited by Percy Livingston Parker. First published by F. H. Revell in 1903; 2016 edition.

Williams, J. Rodman. *Renewal Theology: Systematic Theology from a Charismatic Perspective*. Three Volumes in One. Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan Academic, 1996.

Appendix

These are additional testimonies from Clark's ThD and Dmin students, August 2023 intake, semester 1. Sent via email to the author, December 12-13, 2023.

Dr. Randy Clark. Yes, I do have a sense of loyalty to Dr. Randy Clark, Dr. Tom Jones, and the fantastic instructors at GATS. I know they represent Dr. Clark's love, excellence, gentleness, goodness, longsuffering, passion for Christ and His body, and every one of the fruits of the Spirit. But to him specifically, I say thank you.

Holy Spirit led me to attend my first VOP in 2021(?); I signed up for every available lunch and was washed away by the love of God, passion for ministry, and fellowship. I felt Holy Spirit's urging to attend GATS and ANGA, but I did not feel significant or worthy to join. Then I heard Dr. Clark speak! His shameless compassion for people and pure love and faith in Jesus blew me away.

Later, I witnessed an ordination service and attended a graduation; in one of those settings, Dr. Clark offered to "father" the fatherless. That's when I knew GA, Dr. Randy Clark, was God's gift, His answered prayer, just for lil ole me! At that point, he became a spiritual father and had yet to speak a word directly to me. I was content knowing that God had added me to his list of spiritual sons and daughters. No conversation was necessary! There is no doubt that he, GA, GATS, Dr. Jones, and the rest of the staff, professors, and their anointed TAs have blessed my socks off!

I attend the conferences because Holy Spirit prompts me to attend. The anointing of God is upon this ministry. Therefore, I assumed that whoever speaks at a VOA/VOP or GA-sponsored conference carries the same anointing, love, and presence of God as Dr. Clark. Dr. Clark's ministry is loving and servanthood. He is humble yet aware of his responsibility and balances it with the access to power/influence readily available to/accessible by him. He tells the stories, testimonies, and experiences to point to Christ as the answer, never to himself, people, or his relationship. He could puff out his chest and engage people and his students from a level of inaccessibility and arrogance. Instead, his stories become tangible, repeatable testimonies of faith that encouraged me. I have had the pleasure of going on a GA trip to Brazil. Dr. Clark was among people ministering to them God's healing and deliverance alongside his team. He did not just preach and leave (nothing wrong with this); he chose to roll up his sleeves and go to work.

Dr. Clark is an amazing gift from Heaven, and it is truly an honor and blessing to serve him, learn from him, and replicate his testimonies to the glory of God, the advancement of His Kingdom, and more Lord!

~ Zina White

Dr. Clark has impacted my life beyond words. I only heard about him because someone gave me the book, "There is More!" I was overwhelmed with desire for what Dr. Clark talked about in his book. I wanted impartation from the Holy Spirit. Soon after reading the book I attended a Global Awakening conference called Cultivate Revival in San Antonio, Texas. I immediately encountered Dr. Clark's humble, joyful personality as well as his gentle, loving servanthood. When I told him I was a Lutheran pastor, he immediately invited me to sit at his table for lunch. He also invited me to sit up front in the next session so I could receive a double impartation. It was a glorious experience in the Spirit that changed my life.

I began to read more books by Dr. Clark, attend more conferences, and experience the same humble generosity to bless me on my spiritual journey. I was invited to attend GATS by Dr. Clark for a class he was teaching on Christian Theologies. I was so blessed by all that learned from him in this class. While attending the Greater Things conference in 2022 I received a prophetic word from Christa Smith from the stage that confirmed what the Spirit had been telling me.

I am currently in the D.Min. program as a result of that prophetic word. I knew immediately that I was to study under Dr. Clark to get this degree to help others in my denomination walk in the fullness of the Spirit. Dr. Clark models the life of a true servant of the Lord, faithful theologian who handles the Word of God correctly, and who lives to humbly bless others with gracelets or charisms of the Holy Spirit. I love following Dr. Clark as he follows Jesus! What a journey it has been and the best is yet to come!
~ Jon Beyer

1. Dr. Clark is a credible witness of one who is, both Spirit and Word Rich. His background offers a unique, trustworthy perspective on the Charismata. Many are either Spirit-full or Word-focused but not both. Dr. Clark is biblically grounded theologically sound, and Spirit-Filled.

2. Dr. Clark is one of the few who were present at one of the greatest Revivals of our time. He is not only a fan or a historian of revival, but also one of the key leaders of the Toronto Revival. The fruit of this speaks for itself in how God has used and continues to use him today.

I have read his books and seen countless messages of his online, but sitting in his presence at the intensives was like getting to meet one of your heroes and learning from them firsthand. You cannot get that kind of experience from a book, video, or training. Not many people ever get to meet the pioneers in their fields.

3. Dr. Clark shares many of my Holy Spirit principles.
A. He loves Jesus
B. He loves the Holy Spirit
C. He desires Holiness and fellowship with God

D. He loves the entire body of Christ, He values the ecumenical approach in his theology

4. He is Humble and unassuming.

I found out several years after following Randy Clark that he had a doctorate degree. He doesn't use exclusive or pietistic language in communication with others, especially from other backgrounds.

He doesn't hype up his messages to elicit a certain response from the crowds.

~ Fernando Rocha, Jr.

Dr. Clark and his ministry has greatly impacted my life. The first Global conference I went to he called out dyslexia and stroke. I had a TIA only a year prior so I knew that word was for me. That day I was healed of dyslexia without which I don't think I would have been able to get a masters or be in the doctorate program.

I have a sense of loyalty towards Dr Clark because he is loyal to God. I know he is obedient and sensitive to the Holy Spirit thus I trust his ministry will bring Glory to God.

I attend GATs because I know that it is Spirit and Truth, His presence is valued and cultivated.

I do believe Dr. Clark's leadership is servant hood as I have seen him model it in the way he prays for people and the time he gives his students. Every time he says "Yes," to God, he is choosing to say no to someone or something else, he is sacrificing his time, family and I'm sure more for the sake of obedience. His sacrifice has helped many be to be equipped in the Kingdom, something I will forever be grateful for.

~ Barbara Colacchia

I feel a deep sense of loyalty to Dr. Clark because of his teaching, ministry, and example of humbly following Christ. His teachings on praying for healing for others led to my eventual completion of his Christian Healing Certification Program. He personally encouraged me to join the doctoral program at GATS and to continue learning. I have been a Christian for most of my life, but there is a definite, observable increase in growth in my spiritual walk after connecting with Global Awakening. We (my husband and I) attend his conferences because of his solid teaching on the gifts of the Holy Spirit for today, impartation, and his desire for ecumenism. Dr. Clark is the most humble servant leader I have met. He is approachable, caring, and is genuinely interested in others. He has met with us, prayed for us, and spoken prophetic words over us when he was under no obligation to do so.

~ Carol Knopp